



# Political Science UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Faculty of Arts and Science

Fall 2023

**POL 410H1 F/POL2391H1 F:**

**Topics in Comparative Politics III: Indigenous Research Consortium**  
(Mondays 11am - 1pm)

**Professor Dale Turner**  
Department of Political Science  
Centre for Indigenous Studies  
Office: 563 Spadina Avenue Room 220  
Toronto, Ontario M5S 2J7

**Office hours: By appointment**



“We’re all in the same boat” by Roy Thomas. Accessed at  
<https://museum.mcmaster.ca/about/news/a-documentary-on-canvas/>

## **STATEMENT ON ACKNOWLEDGEMENT OF TRADITIONAL LAND**

We would like to acknowledge this sacred land on which the University of Toronto operates. It has been a site of human activity for 15,000 years. This land is the territory of the Huron-Wendat and Petun First Nations, the Seneca, and most recently, the Mississaugas of the Credit River. The territory was the subject of the Dish with One Spoon Wampum Belt Covenant, an agreement between the Iroquois Confederacy and Confederacy of the Ojibwe and allied nations to

peaceably share and care for the resources around the Great Lakes. Today, the meeting place of Toronto is still the home to many Indigenous people from across Turtle Island and we are grateful to have the opportunity to work in the community, on this territory.

Revised by the Elders Circle (Council of Aboriginal Initiatives) on November 6, 2014.

Information is available at <https://indigenous.utoronto.ca/about/land-acknowledgement/>

See also: <http://www.lspirg.org/knowtheland/>

**Seminar Description** The main theme of this seminar is about listening, especially to Indigenous peoples within the legal and political relationship. We will centre this theme around the question, “What does it mean to listen to Indigenous peoples ‘in and on their own terms’?” By the end of week two you will have been introduced to what I take to be a fundamental philosophical problem in contemporary Indigenous politics: Indigenous peoples’ traditional understandings of their relationships to land appear to be incompatible with the state’s understanding of Indigenous rights. This problem is embodied in two important cases in Canadian law: the Van der Peet decision (1996) and the Delgamuukw decision (1997). We begin with the Van der Peet/Delgamuukw cases then resituate the fundamental philosophical problem in three different, though related, contexts: Māori relationships to land, within a politics of land acknowledgements, and within the current treaty negotiations between Temagami First Nation/Teme-Augama Anishinaabe and the Ontario government.

You do not need to have an in-depth knowledge of the legal and political relationship between Indigenous peoples and the Canadian state to take this seminar – but it certainly helps. If you feel the need to do some background reading, I suggest JR Miller’s *Skyscrapers Hide the Heavens* as a good accessible account of the history of the relationship. His approach to understanding the evolution of the historical relationship influenced a generation of scholars, some of whom you will read in the seminar.

The seminar is divided into three parts.

**Part 1:** We begin the seminar with a brief genealogy of the legal and political relationship between Indigenous peoples and the Canadian state, from the Hawthorn Report (1966-67) to the present. This investigation highlights the important legal and political milestones over the past few decades, but also shows that Indigenous peoples have consistently asserted two fundamental claims about the nature of the legal and political relationship between Indigenous peoples and the Canadian state:

1 – Indigenous peoples and European newcomers are inextricably embedded in a treaty relationship; and,

2 – Indigenous peoples’ self-understandings of their relationships to their homelands are “spiritual” in nature.

The treaty relationship will be front and centre in this seminar; however, we will devote considerable time over the next few months reflecting on the meaning and significance of the second claim. What is Indigenous spirituality? How do we make sense of it, especially in the

legal and political relationship? What role, if any, should Indigenous spirituality play in contemporary Indigenous politics?

**Part 2:** In the second part of the seminar, we resituate the fundamental philosophical problem in three different (but related) contexts in contemporary Indigenous politics: Māori relationships to their homelands, the current culture of land acknowledgements in Canada, and the on-the-ground politics of treaty negotiations in the Temagami First Nation/Teme-Augama Anishinaabe. We are fortunate to welcome into our learning circle several prominent scholars, writers, leaders, and medicine people who will help us understand better what it means for Indigenous peoples to speak for themselves in contemporary Indigenous politics. (We will see that it is one thing to speak, it is quite another thing to be heard.)

**Indigenous relationships to land:**

Māori guests - September 25

**On the Politics of Land Acknowledgements:**

Massey College Visit, October 16

Professor Hayden King, Toronto Metropolitan University, October 30

**Temagami First Nation treaty negotiations:**

Ogima Shelly Moore of the Temagami First Nation, Ogima [elections are today!] Teme-Augama Anishinaabe, Mary Laronde, Teme-Augama Anishinaabe

**Part 3:** In the third part of the seminar, as a culminating class activity, we return to the problem of listening to Indigenous peoples “in and on their own terms” and draw together some conclusions about how we – *meaning all of us* – can better understand the meaning and significance of Indigenous voices in Indigenous politics. The seminar ends with students sharing their thoughts from their journals.

**Seminar objectives:** The seminar is intended to be evolutionary in its approach; that is, over 13 weeks, we will create and nurture a dialogical community in order to gain greater insights into how Indigenous peoples understand and articulate their perspectives in the contemporary legal and political relationship.

**Seminar Readings:**

**All readings will be available on Quercus.**

**Grading:**

**Journal writing (80%)**      **You will keep a journal for 13 weeks during the seminar. I will say more about this style of writing in the first week.**

**Two 1-2 page essays (10%)**      **Pretty standard short formal first-person essays.**

**Packback (10%)**      **I will say more about this in the first class, too.**

**Seminar Schedule:**

**Week 1 (Sept 11, 2023)      Introduction – Brief History of Indigenous Politics in Canada**  
**Reading:**

JR Miller, Chapter 16 of *Skyscrapers hide the heavens: a history of Native-newcomer relations in Canada*, University of Toronto Press, 2017

Sally Weaver, Chapter 1 of Making Indian Policy in *Making Canadian Indian Policy: The Hidden Agenda 1968–1970*, University of Toronto Press, 1981

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, “Volume 1 - Looking Forward Looking Back PART ONE: The Relationship in Historical Perspective” from RCAP’s Final Report

Optional Readings (Required for graduate students)

John Borrows, “Frozen Rights in Canada: Constitutional Interpretation and the Trickster”, *American Indian Law Review*, Vol. 22 No.1

**Week 2 (Sept 18, 2023)      Listening to Indigenous Peoples “in and on their own terms” or should Indigenous students read Wittgenstein?**

**Reading:**

Dale Turner, On the Politics of Indigenous Translation in *Routledge Handbook of Critical Indigenous Studies*, Routledge, 2020

The Statement of the Government on Indian Policy 1969 (“The White Paper”)

Indian Chiefs of Alberta, Citizens Plus, *Aboriginal Policy Studies*, Vol. 1, no. 2, 2011, pp. 188-281 (“The Red Paper”)

RCAP Report, “Principles of a Renewed Relationship”, Volume One: Looking Forward Looking Back

**Week 3 (Sept 25, 2023)      Māori Visitors**  
**Professor Jacinta Ruru, Professor Carwyn Jones; Annette Sykes, and Te Ringahui Hata**

**Reading:**

**TBA**

**Week 4 (Oct 2, 2023)      Theoretical Interlude: Below and Against the State**  
**Seminar guest: Professor Corey Snelgrove, University of Alberta**

**Reading:**

Howard Adams, “Constitutional Colonialism” from *A Tortured People: The Politics of Colonization* (1995)

Leanne Simpson, Selections from *As We Have Always Done* (2018: 22, 228-231)

Week 5 (Oct 9, 2023)	No Class – Read <i>Rehearsals for Living</i>
Week 6 (Oct 16, 2023)	<u>Massey College and Re-Visiting the Treaty Relationship</u> Seminar meets at Massey College
Week 7 (Oct 23, 2023)	<u>On the Politics of Land Acknowledgements: A Conversation with Hayden King and the Yellowhead Institute</u> Guest: Hayden King
Week 8 (Oct 30, 2023)	Discussion...
Week 9 (Nov 6, 2023)	Reading Week
Week 10 (Nov 13, 2023)	<u>Aboriginal Rights in Canada: Weaving Legal Traditions</u> Guests: Professor Joshua Nichols Reading: TBA
Week 11 (Nov 20, 2023)	<u>TBA – I will be away</u>
Week 12 (Nov 27, 2023)	<u>Temagami First Nation/Teme-Augama Anishinaabe</u> Guests: Ogima Shelly Moore (Temagami First Nation); Ogima Leanna Farr (Teme-Augama Anishinaabe); Mary Laronde
Week 13 (Dec 4, 2023)	<u>Journal Readings</u>

## Packback Questions

Participation is a requirement for this course, and the Packback Questions platform will be used for online discussion about class topics. Packback Questions is an online community where you can be fearlessly curious and ask open-ended questions to build on top of what we are covering in class and relate topics to real-world applications.

### Packback Requirements:

Your participation on Packback will count toward 10% of your overall course grade.

There will be a **Sundays at 11:59PM EST** deadline for submissions. In order to receive full credit, you should submit the following:

- **One Question and Two Responses**

## Packback Deep Dives

Packback Deep Dives will be used to assess independent research skills and improve academic communication through long-form writing assignments such as essays, papers, and case studies. While completing the summative writing prompts on Deep Dives, you will interact with a Research Assistant that will help you gather your notes and cite your sources, and Digital Writing Assistant for in-the-moment feedback and guidance on your writing.

Deep Dives Requirements: TBD during Week 1

Here are your Deep Dives assignments for this course:

**Assignment Title:**

**Due Date:**

**Grade Value:**

## How to Register on Packback:

An email invitation will be sent to you from [help@packback.co](mailto:help@packback.co) prompting you to finish registration. If you don't receive an email (be sure to check your spam), you may register by following the instructions below:

1. Create an account by navigating to <https://app.packback.ca> and clicking "Sign up for an Account"

Note: If you already have an account on Packback you can log in with your credentials.

2. Then enter our class community's lookup key into the "Looking to join a community you don't see here?" section in Packback at the bottom of the homepage.  
Community Lookup Key: **5bdd2a07-b9c6-43be-a6e7-9a3df387398d**

3. Follow the instructions on your screen to finish your registration.

Packback may require a paid subscription. Refer to [www.packback.co/product/pricing](https://www.packback.co/product/pricing) for more information.

**How to Get Help from the Packback Team:**

If you have any questions or concerns about Packback throughout the semester, please read their FAQ at [help.packback.co](https://help.packback.co). If you need more help, contact their customer support team directly at [help@packback.co](mailto:help@packback.co).

For a brief introduction to Packback Questions and why we are using it in class, watch this video: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=OV7QmkrD68>