

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

POLITICAL SCIENCE 485S/2027S

**COMPARATIVE TOPICS IN JEWISH AND NON-JEWISH
POLITICAL THOUGHT II**

WINTER TERM 2023

Professor C. Orwin (clifford.orwin@utoronto.ca)

Our theme throughout this year (embracing both POL 485F/2027F and POL 485S/2027S) will be despotism and the conditions of successful resistance to it, whether such resistance is external or internal. We will explore it through a careful reading of Herodotus' *Histories* and the Book of Esther. In both cases the despotic power to be feared is Persia, and the settings of the two narratives are supposed to be roughly contemporaneous. In both cases we will consider the role of piety in supporting both despotism and resistance to it (a subject in which Herodotus takes no less interest than the author of Esther). As the Greek work is in this case much longer than the Jewish one, as well as being the older of the two, we will read it first and spend far more time on it. In the winter term we will read the last five books of Herodotus, the ones devoted to the Persian Wars proper, and the Book of Esther. As Herodotus details the dilemmas of the Greek response to the threat posed by the Persian Empire, so Esther relates those of the Jewish one.

NOTE THAT CLASS SESSIONS WILL RUN FOR THREE AND A HALF HOURS INSTEAD OF THE USUAL TWO. THERE WILL BE TWO BREAKS DURING IN EACH SESSION.

RECOMMENDED EDITIONS

Herodotus, *Histories*. Translated by David Grene. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.

Edition of Esther TBA

REQUIRED SECONDARY READINGS ON HERODOTUS

Benardete, Seth. *Herodotean Inquiries*. Revised edition, with a new preface by the author. South Bend, IN: St. Augustine's Press, 2008

TWO OTHER EDITIONS OF HERODOTUS, ON TWO HOUR RESERVE AT ROBARTS

The Landmark Herodotus. The Histories. Translated by Andrea L. Purvis. New York: Pantheon Books, 2007 [D58 .H4713 2007X](#)

Herodotus. *The Histories.* Translated by Robin Waterfield; with an introduction and notes by Carolyn Dewald. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2008 [D58 .H5 2008](#)

Neither of these translations is to be recommended, but both editions contain much valuable secondary material (a wealth of maps and appendices, in the case of the Landmark edition; and the very useful introduction and notes by Carolyn Dewald in the Oxford). You might wish to acquire them for yourselves.

RECOMMENDED SECONDARY READINGS

PLEASE NOTE: YOU ARE NOT EXPECTED TO READ ALL OR EVEN MANY OF THESE SOURCES. YOU WILL BE EXPECTED TO READ SOME OF THEM (OR OTHERS THAT YOU DISCOVER ON YOUR OWN) AND CITE THEM IN YOUR OWN ESSAYS.

THE BOOKS AND ARTICLES MARKED WITH AN ASTERISK WILL BE ON TWO HOUR RESERVE IN THE SHORT TERM LOAN READING ROOM ON THE THIRD FLOOR OF ROBARTS LIBRARY. WHEN A BOOK IS AVAILABLE AS AN ELECTRONIC RESOURCE, NO PHYSICAL COPIES OF IT WILL BE PLACED ON RESERVE, SO YOU WILL BE FREE TO SEEK THE PHYSICAL COPY/IES AT ITS (THEIR) HOME LIBRARIES.

RECOMMENDED SECONDARY READINGS ON HERODOTUS

Arieti, James A. *Discourses on the first book of Herodotus.* Lanham, Md. : Littlefield Adams Books, 1995. [D/58/A75/1995X](#)

Baragwanath, Emily. *Motivation and Narrative in Herodotus.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008. [PA 4004 B3& 2008](#) [electronic resource]

_____, and Mathieu de Bakker, ed. *Myth, truth, and narrative in Herodotus.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012. [electronic resource]

Clarke, Katherine. *Shaping the geography of Empire: man and nature in Herodotus' histories.* Oxford : Oxford University Press, 2018. **Available on line.**

Dewald, Carolyn, and John Marincola, ed. *The Cambridge Companion to Herodotus*.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006. [PA4004 .C36 2006](#)

Evans, J. A. S. *Herodotus, explorer of the past: three essays*.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991. D 56 .52 H45E93 1991

Flory, Stewart. *The archaic smile of Herodotus*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1987. PA 4007 F56 1987

Fornara, Charles W. *Herodotus: an interpretative essay*.* Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1971. PA 4004 F6

Harrison, Thomas J. *Divinity and history: the religion of Herodotus*. Oxford, UK: Clarendon Press; New York: Oxford University Press, 2000. D 58 .H7H28 2000

Hartog, François. *Le miroir d'Hérodote: essai sur la représentation de l'autre*. Paris: Gallimard, 1980. PA 4004 H346 1983587

How, W. W. *A commentary on Herodotus*.* With introd. and appendixes by W.W. How and J. Wells. Oxford: Clarendon Press [1961] (2 Vols.) PA 4004 H6 1961

Immerwahr, Henry R. *Form and thought in Herodotus*. Cleveland: American Philological Association, 1966. PA 4004 I4

Keith, Sidney Robert. *The first political scientist: Herodotus of Halicarnassus**. theses POLEC 1989 Ph.D. 3615 (A dissertation written under my direction, which I've found highly useful.)

Maddalena, Antonio. *Interpretazioni erodotee*. Padova: CEDAM, Casa editrice dott. A. Milani, 1942 PA/4004/M2

Mahon, Lindsay. *Herodotean Journeys: Diversity and Political Judgment in Herodotus' Histories*. (Another dissertation written under my direction of which I will make extensive use. See also below, under Rathnam.)

Munson, Rosaria Vignolo. *Telling wonders: ethnographic and political discourse in the work of Herodotus*.* Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2001. D 58 .M85 2001

Orwin, Clifford, "Democracy in motion: some reflections on Herodotean politics." In Nalin Ranasinghe, ed., *Logos and eros: essays honoring Stanley Rosen*.* South Bend: St. Augustine's Press, 2006, pp. 118-133. [BD41 .L64 2006X](#)

_____. "Empire and liberty, with the benefit of limited hindsight – or what Herodotus of Halicarnassus saw." In David _____, *Three lectures on Herodotus*, delivered in Lisbon in April 2005, available from Prof. Orwin

Powell, J. Enoch. *The history of Herodotus*. Cambridge: at the University Press, 1939. D 58 H7P6

Rathnam, Lindsay Mahon. "*The Madness of Cambyses: Herodotus and the Problem of Inquiry*." *Polis* 35.1 (2018), 61-82. (Electronic Resource)

Romm, James S. *Herodotus*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998. D 56.52 .H45R66 1998X

Rosen, Stanley. "Herodotus reconsidered." *Giornale di metafisica* 18 (1963), 194-218
AVAILABLE AT THE PONTIFICAL INSTITUTE OF MEDIEVAL STUDIES
LIBRARY BUT NOT CATALOGUED IN THE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY'S ON LINE
CATALOGUE (AS NO JOURNALS AT PIMS ARE).

- _____. "Herodotus reconsidered." A reprint of the preceding, but minus the copious footnotes and with one elision. In Walter Blanco and Jennifer Tolbert Roberts, ed. *Herodotus. The Histories*. New York: Norton, 1992, pp. 332-56. [D58 .H4 1992](#)
- _____. "Philosophy and revolution" in his volume *The Quarrel Between Philosophy and Poetry: Studies in Ancient Thought* (New York and London: Routledge, Chapman & Hall, 1988). At pp. 33-47 of this essay, Rosen reworks about half of the study previously mentioned. [B73 .R67 1988](#)
- Shimron, Binyamin. *Politics and belief in Herodotus*. Stuttgart: F. Steiner Verlag, 1989. PA 4004 S54 1989
- Thomas, Rosalind. *Herodotus in context: ethnography, science, and the art of persuasion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000. D 58 .T46 2000
- Thompson, Norma. *Herodotus and the origins of the political community: Arion's leap**. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1996. JC/71/H47T48/1996X
- Ward, Ann. *Herodotus and the philosophy of empire.** Waco: Baylor University Press, 2008. [D58 .H7 W37 2008 SMC](#)
- Plutarch. *De malignitate Herodoti*. English & Greek., translated with an introduction and commentary by Anthony Bowen.* Warminster, Wiltshire : Aris & Phillips, 1992. PA/4368/D4313/1992 (Or any other edition of Plutarch's essay.)

RECOMMENDED SECONDARY READINGS ON ESTHER. ITEMS MARKED WITH AN ASTERISK WILL BE ON TWO HOUR RESERVE AT ROBARTS FROM MARCH 1, 2023. THIS LIST WILL BE UPDATED TO NOTE ALL ELECTRONIC SOURCES.

- Berlin, Adele, ed. *Esther.** JPS Bible Commentary Series. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 2001. BS 1373 .B47 2001X ROBA 1 Berlin stresses, among other things, Hellenistic influences in the work.
- Bickerman, E. J. *Four strange books of the Bible: Jonah, Daniel, Koheleth, Esther.** New York : Schocken Books, 1967. BS 1200 .B5 1967 Bickerman was one of the most original and outspoken 20th C. interpreters of Hellenistic Judaism, stressing the pervasive Hellenistic influence on the Rabbinic tradition where one might least think to find it.
- Daube, David. *Esther.** Yarnton, Oxford, England: Oxford Centre for Postgraduate Hebrew Studies, 1995. BS 1375.3 .D28 1995 ROBA 1 Daube, Regius Professor of Civil Law at Oxford, was a great scholar of literature and history as well as law, and of the Hellenic tradition as well as the Jewish one.
- Feldman, Louis H. *Josephus's interpretation of the Bible*. Berkeley : University of California Press, 1998. DS 116 .J744 .F45 1998X ROBA Check s.v. Esther in the index
_____. *Studies in Josephus' rewritten Bible*. Leiden ; New York: Brill, 1998. DS 115.9 .J6F46 1998X ROBA 1
- Fox, Michael V. *Character and ideology in the book of Esther*. Columbia, SC: USC Press, 1991. BS 1375 .3 F694 1991
- Green, Alex. "Power, deception, and comedy: the politics of exile in the Book of Esther." *Jewish Political Studies Review* 23:1-2 (Spring 2011). An excellent essay by a former student in this

course. Available at

<http://www.jcpa.org/JCPA/Templates/ShowPage.asp?DRIT=5&DBID=1&LNGID=1&TMID=111&FID=625&PID=0&IID=8191&TTL=Power, Deception, and Comedy: The Politics of Exile in the Book of Esther>

Hazon, Yoram. *The dawn: political teachings of the Book of Esther*. * Jerusalem : Genesis Press, 1995. BS 1375.3 .H39 1995 ROBA 1 Hazon is the American educated founder of an Israeli movement roughly corresponding to neo-conservatism. As his title implies, he treats *Esther* as a political work first and foremost.

Josephus. *Antiquities of the Jews*, XI.6. Many editions available.

Levenson, J. D. *Esther: a commentary*. * Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1997.

BS 1375.3 .L48 1997X ROBA 1 One of the most highly regarded recent commentaries.

Orwin, Clifford. "The piety of Esther." In Andrea M. Radasanu, ed., *The Pious Sex: essays on women and religion in the history of political thought*, pp. 15-34.* Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2010. [BL458 .P54 2010X](#) ALSO AVAILABLE FROM PROFESSOR ORWIN

Segal, Eliezer. *The Babylonian Esther midrash: a critical commentary*. Atlanta, Ga.: Scholars Press, c1994. BS/1375/.3/S44/1994X

Stern, Elsie R. "Esther and the politics of the diaspora." *Jewish Quarterly Review*, Vol. 100, No. 1 (Winter 2010) 25-53 AVAILABLE FROM PROFESSOR ORWIN

COURSE ASSIGNMENTS AND MARKING SCHEME

POL 485S (the undergraduate course). Two essays of 2750 words each, due Friday, February 10 (25% of final Mark), and Friday, March 17 (35%); a take-home final exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, March 31, due at 11 AM on Monday, April 3 (25% of final mark). Attendance and participation will count for 15% of the final mark.

POL 2027S (the graduate course). Two essays, on topics of the student's own devising, one of 2750 words, due Friday, February 10, one of no more than 5000 words, due April 14; a take-home exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, March 31, due at 11 AM on Monday, April 3, the first assignment worth 20% of the final mark, each of the last two 40%.

PLEASE UPLOAD YOUR ESSAYS ELECTRONICALLY THROUGH QUERCUS, THEREBY SPARING CANADA'S FORESTS.

N.B. In the graduate course as in the undergraduate one, no extensions will be granted on written work except for good cause. In keeping with Nietzsche's theory of punishment, however, according to which every crime has its price and punishment was originally nothing more than an exaction of that price (cf. *On the Genealogy of Morals*, Second Essay), extensions will be readily available to those willing to purchase them. The price will be 3 points, plus 2 additional points per day beginning with the first, off your mark for that assignment. (If you are one day late you will lose 5 points; two days late, 7; etc.). This proviso does not apply to take-home exams, which will not be accepted if late.

You are responsible for informing yourself of and abiding by the University's policies on plagiarism and other academic offenses. <https://www.academicintegrity.utoronto.ca/>

MR. ORWIN'S OFFICE HOURS

Wednesdays 1:45-4:15, at SS 3055 (or by appointment.) You can e-mail me at any time at clifford.orwin@utoronto.ca.

Course Assignments and Marking Scheme

POPOL 430Y (the undergraduate course). Four essays, one of 1375 words due Friday, October 18, three of 2750 words each, due November 22, January 24, and March 28; a take-home exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, March 21, due at 11 AM on Monday, March 24). The first essay will be worth 10% of the final mark, each of the following three will be worth 20%, the take-home exam will be worth 25%, and there will be 5% for participation.

POL 2021Y (the graduate course). Three essays, on topics of the student's own devising, due October 25, January 10, and April 18; a take-home exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, March 21, due at 11 AM on Monday, March 24; each assignment worth a fourth of the final mark. Essays must not exceed 5500 words and will not be read beyond the 5500th word. (There will be a much lower word limit for the take-home exam.)

PLEASE SUBMIT YOUR ESSAYS ELECTRONICALLY, THEREBY SPARING CANADA'S FORESTS.

N.B. In the graduate course as in the undergraduate one, no extensions will be granted on written work except for good cause. In keeping with Nietzsche's theory of punishment, however,

according to which every crime has its price and punishment was originally nothing more than an exaction of that price (cf. *On the Genealogy of Morals*, Second Essay), extensions will be readily available to those willing to purchase them. The price will be 3 points, plus 2 additional points per day beginning with the first, off your mark for that assignment. (If you

are one day late you will lose 5 points; two days late, 7; etc.). This proviso does not apply to the take-home exam, which will not be accepted if late.

You are responsible for informing yourself of and abiding by the University's policies on plagiarism and other academic offenses. These are available at the Department of Political Science or from the instructor.

MR ORWIN'S OFFICE HOURS

Wednesdays, 3:00-5:00, at Alumni Hall 323 (926-1300, ext. 3277) on even-dated Wednesdays and at Sidney Smith Hall 3055 (978-0747) on odd-dated ones. (Or by appointment.) Messages are better left at the first of these numbers, where I have voice mail.