

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

POLITICAL SCIENCE 485F/2027F

**COMPARATIVE TOPICS IN JEWISH AND NON-JEWISH
POLITICAL THOUGHT**

FALL TERM 2022

Professor C. Orwin (clifford.orwin@utoronto.ca)

Our theme throughout this year (embracing both POL 485F/2027F and POL 485S/2027S) will be despotism and the conditions of successful resistance to it, whether such resistance is external or internal. We will explore it through a careful reading of Herodotus' *Histories* and the Book of Esther. In both cases the despotic power to be feared is Persia, and the settings of the two dramas are supposed to be roughly contemporaneous. In both cases we will consider the role of piety in supporting both despotism and resistance to it (a subject in which Herodotus takes no less interest than the author of Esther). As the Greek work is in this case much longer than the Jewish one, as well as being the older of the two, we will read it first and be spending far more time on it. This term we will read the first five books of Herodotus; next term the remaining four books and Esther. The first term will be a prerequisite for the second, but will also stand on its own as a half course for those who do not wish to continue beyond it.

**NOTE THAT CLASS SESSIONS WILL RUN FOR THREE AND A HALF HOURS
INSTEAD OF THE USUAL TWO. WE WILL TAKE A LONGISH BREAK IN THE
MIDDLE OF EACH.**

RECOMMENDED EDITION OF HERODOTUS).

Herodotus, *The History*. Translated by David Grene. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.

REQUIRED SECONDARY READINGS ON HERODOTUS

Benardete, Seth. *Herodotean Inquiries*. Revised edition, with a new preface by the author. South Bend, IN: St. Augustine's Press, 2008

TWO OTHER EDITIONS OF HERODOTUS, ON TWO HOUR RESERVE AT ROBARTS

The Landmark Herodotus. The Histories. Translated by Andrea L. Purvis. New York: Pantheon Books, 2007 [D58 .H4713 2007X](#)

Herodotus. *The Histories.* Translated by Robin Waterfield; with an introduction and notes by Carolyn Dewald. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2008 [D58 .H5 2008](#)

Neither of these translations is to be recommended, but both editions contain much valuable secondary material (a wealth of maps and appendices, in the case of the Landmark edition; and the very useful introduction and notes by Carolyn Dewald in the Oxford). You might wish to acquire them for yourselves.

RECOMMENDED SECONDARY READINGS

THE BOOKS AND ARTICLES MARKED WITH AN ASTERISK WILL BE ON TWO HOUR RESERVE IN THE SHORT TERM LOAN READING ROOM ON THE THIRD FLOOR OF ROBERTS LIBRARY. WHEN A BOOK IS AVAILABLE AS AN ELECTRONIC RESOURCE, NO PHYSICAL COPIES OF IT WILL BE PLACED ON RESERVE, SO YOU WILL BE FREE TO SEEK THE PHYSICAL COPY/IES AT ITS (THEIR) HOME LIBRARIES.

Baragwanath, Emily. *Motivation and Narrative in Herodotus.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008. PA 4004 B3& 2008. **AVAILABLE ON LINE**

_____, and Mathieu de Bakker, ed. *Myth, truth, and narrative in Herodotus.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012. [electronic resource] **AVAILABLE ONLINE**

Clarke, Katherine. *Shaping the geography of Empire: man and nature in Herodotus' histories.* Oxford : Oxford University Press, 2018. **AVAILABLE ONLINE**

Dewald, Carolyn, and John Marincola, ed. *The Cambridge Companion to Herodotus.* * Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006. PA4004 .C36 2006

Evans, J. A. S. *Herodotus, explorer of the past: three essays.** Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991. D 56 .52 H45E93 1991

Flory, Stewart. *The archaic smile of Herodotus.* Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1987. PA 4007 F56 1987

Hartog, François. *The mirror of Herodotus: the representation of the other in the writing of history.* Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988. **AVAILABLE ONLINE**

Keith, Sidney Robert. *The first political scientist: Herodotus of Halicarnassus**. theses POLEC 1989 Ph.D. 3615 (A dissertation written under my direction).

Lachenaud, Guy. *Mythologies, religion et philosophie de l'histoire dans Herodote.* Lille: Atelier reproduction des theses, Université de Lille III ; Paris: Diffusion, Librairie H. Champion, 1978. PA 4004 L32 1978

Lateiner, Donald. *The Historical Method of Herodotus*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2016

AVAILABLE ONLINE

Maddalena, Antonio. *Interpretazioni erodotee*. Padova: CEDAM, Casa editrice dott. A. Milani, 1942
PA/4004/M2

Mahon, Lindsay. *Herodotean Journeys: Diversity and Political Judgment in Herodotus' Histories*. Ann Arbor : ProQuest Dissertations & Theses, 2018. Another dissertation written under my direction, soon to be a book. **AVAILABLE ONLINE** See also below, s.v. Rathnam.

Munson, Rosaria Vignolo. *Telling wonders: ethnographic and political discourse in the work of Herodotus*. * Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2001. D 58 .M85 2001

Orwin, Clifford, "Democracy in motion: some reflections on Herodotean politics." In Nalin Ransinghe, ed., *Logos and eros: essays honoring Stanley Rosen*. * South Bend: St. Augustine's Press, 2006, pp. 118-133. BD41 .L64 2006X

_____. "Empire and liberty, with the benefit of limited hindsight – or what Herodotus of Halicarnassus saw." In David L. Tabachnick and Toivu Koivukoski, ed. *Enduring Empire: ancient lessons for global politics* *. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2009, pp. 69-76. JC359 .E54 2009

Rathnam, Lindsay Mahon. "The Madness of Cambyses: Herodotus and the Problem of Inquiry." *Polis* 35.1 (2018), 61-82. **AVAILABLE ONLINE**

-----, "The Marketplace of Ideas and the Agora: Herodotus on the Power of Isegoria." *American Political Science Review*, forthcoming.

Rosen, Stanley. "Herodotus reconsidered." *Giornale di metafisica* 18 (1963), 194-218. AVAILABLE AT THE PONTIFICAL INSTITUTE OF MEDIEVAL STUDIES LIBRARY BUT NOT CATALOGUED IN THE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY'S ON LINE CATALOGUE (AS NO JOURNALS AT PIMS ARE).

_____. "Herodotus reconsidered." A reprint of the preceding, but minus the copious footnotes and with one elision. In Walter Blanco and Jennifer Tolbert Roberts, ed. *Herodotus. The Histories*. New York: Norton, 1992, pp. 332-56. D58 .H4 1992

_____. "Philosophy and revolution." In Rosen, *The Quarrel Between Philosophy and Poetry: Studies in Ancient Thought*. New York and London: Routledge, Chapman & Hall, 1988. At pp. 33-47 of this essay, Rosen reworks about half of the study previously mentioned. B73 .R67 1988

Shimron, Binyamin. *Politics and belief in Herodotus*. Stuttgart: F. Steiner Verlag, 1989. PA 4004 S54 1989

Thomas, Rosalind. *Herodotus in context: ethnography, science, and the art of persuasion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000. D 58 .T46 2000

Thompson, Norma. *Herodotus and the origins of the political community: Arion's leap* *. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1996. JC/71/H47T48/1996X

Ward, Ann. *Herodotus and the philosophy of empire*. * Waco: Baylor University Press, 2008. D58 .H7 W37 2008 SMC

Plutarch. *De malignitate Herodoti*. English & Greek., translated with an introduction and commentary by Anthony Bowen.* Warminster, Wiltshire : Aris & Phillips, 1992. PA/4368/D4313/1992 (Or any other edition of Plutarch's essay.)

COURSE ASSIGNMENTS AND MARKING SCHEME

POL 485F (the undergraduate course). Two essays of 2750 words each, due Friday, October 7, and Friday, November 18; a take-home final exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, November 25, due at 11 AM on Monday, November 28). The first essay and the take-home exam will each count for 25% of the final mark, the second essay for 35%, and attendance and participation will count for 15%.

POL 2027F (the graduate course). Two essays, on topics of the student's own devising, one of 2750 words, due October 14, one of no more than 5000 words, due December 12; a take-home exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, November 25, due at 11 AM on Monday, November 28); the first assignment worth 20% of the final mark, each of the last two 40%.

There will be no seminar meeting on October 4 so students will be free that week to focus on their first essays and broaden their reading in the course.

**IN THIS COURSE AS IN ALL OTHERS IN THE FACULTY OF ARTS AND SCIENCE,
STUDENTS ARE BOUND BY THE FACULTY'S POLICIES ON ACADEMIC INTEGRITY.**

<https://www.artsci.utoronto.ca/current/academic-advising-and-support/student-academic-integrity>

Lachenaud, Guy. *Mythologies, religion et philosophie de l'histoire dans Herodote*. Lille: Atelier reproduction des theses, Université de Lille III ; Paris: Diffusion, Librairie H. Champion, 1978. PA 4004 L32 1978

Lateiner, Donald, and Edith Foster.

Maddalena, Antonio. *Interpretazioni erodotee*. Padova: CEDAM, Casa editrice dott. A. Milani, 1942 PA/4004/M2

Munson, Rosaria Vignolo. *Telling wonders: ethnographic and political discourse in the work of Herodotus*. * Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2001. D 58 .M85 2001

Orwin, Clifford, "Democracy in motion: some reflections on Herodotean politics." In Nalin Ranasinghe, ed., *Logos and eros: essays honoring Stanley Rosen*. * South Bend: St. Augustine's Press, 2006, pp. 118-133. [BD41 .L64 2006X](#)

_____. "Empire and liberty, with the benefit of limited hindsight – or what Herodotus of Halicarnassus saw." In David L. Tabachnick and Toivu Koivukoski, ed. *Enduring Empire: ancient lessons for global politics* *. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2009, pp. 69-76. [JC359 .E54 2009](#)

_____. Three lectures on Herodotus, delivered in Lisbon in April 2005, available from Prof. Orwin

Powell, J. Enoch. *The history of Herodotus*. Cambridge: at the University Press, 1939. D 58 H7P6

Lindsay Mahon. *Herodotean Journeys: Diversity and Political Judgment in Herodotus' Histories*

(Another dissertation written under my direction of which I will make extensive use.)

[Rathnam], Lindsay Mahon. "*The Madness of Cambyses: Herodotus and the Problem of Inquiry*." *Polis* 35.1 (2018), 61-82. (Electronic Resource)

Romm, James S. *Herodotus*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998. D 56.52 .H45R66 1998X

Rosen, Stanley. "Herodotus reconsidered." *Giornale di metafisica* 18 (1963), 194-218

AVAILABLE AT THE PONTIFICAL INSTITUTE OF MEDIEVAL STUDIES LIBRARY BUT NOT CATALOGUED IN THE UNIVERSITY LIBRARY'S ON LINE CATALOGUE (AS NO JOURNALS AT PIMS ARE).

_____. "Herodotus reconsidered." A reprint of the preceding, but minus the copious footnotes and with one elision. In Walter Blanco and Jennifer Tolbert Roberts, ed. *Herodotus. The Histories*. New York: Norton, 1992, pp. 332-56. [D58 .H4 1992](#)

_____. "Philosophy and revolution" in his volume *The Quarrel Between Philosophy and Poetry: Studies in Ancient Thought* (New York and London: Routledge, Chapman & Hall, 1988). At pp. 33-47 of this essay, Rosen reworks about half of the study previously mentioned. [B73 .R67 1988](#)

Shimron, Binyamin. *Politics and belief in Herodotus*. Stuttgart: F. Steiner Verlag, 1989. PA 4004 S54 1989

Thomas, Rosalind. *Herodotus in context: ethnography, science, and the art of persuasion*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000. D 58 .T46 2000

Thompson, Norma. *Herodotus and the origins of the political community: Arion's leap* *. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1996. [JC/71/H47T48/1996X](#)

Ward, Ann. *Herodotus and the philosophy of empire*. * Waco: Baylor University Press, 2008. [D58 .H7 W37 2008 SMC](#)

Plutarch. *De malignitate Herodoti*. English & Greek., translated with an introduction and commentary by Anthony Bowen.* Warminster, Wiltshire : Aris & Phillips, 1992. PA/4368/D4313/1992 (Or any other edition of Plutarch's essay.)

COURSE ASSIGNMENTS AND MARKING SCHEME

POL 430Y (the undergraduate course). Two essays of 2750 words each, due Friday, October 7 (25% of final Mark), and Friday, November 18 (35%); a take-home final exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, November 25, due at 11 AM on Monday, November 28 (25% of final mark). Attendance and participation will count for 15% of the final mark.

POL 2021Y (the graduate course). Two essays, on topics of the student's own devising, one of 2750 words, due October 14, one of no more than 5000 words, due December 12; a take-home exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, November 25, due at 11 AM on Monday, November 28; the first assignment worth 20% of the final mark, each of the last two 40%.

There will be no seminar meeting on October 4 so students will be free that week to focus on their first essays and broaden their reading in the course.

PLEASE SUBMIT YOUR ESSAYS ELECTRONICALLY, THEREBY SPARING CANADA'S FORESTS.

N.B. In the graduate course as in the undergraduate one, no extensions will be granted on written work except for good cause. In keeping with Nietzsche's theory of punishment, however, according to which every crime has its price and punishment was originally nothing more than an exaction of that price (cf. *On the Genealogy of Morals*, Second Essay), extensions will be readily available to those willing to purchase them. The price will be 3 points, plus 2 additional points per day beginning with the first, off your mark for that assignment. (If you

are one day late you will lose 5 points; two days late, 7; etc.). This proviso does not apply to take-home exams, which will not be accepted if late.

You are responsible for informing yourself of and abiding by the University's policies on plagiarism and other academic offenses. These are available at the Department of Political Science or from the instructor.

MR. ORWIN'S OFFICE HOURS

Wednesdays 4-6, at Carr Hall 312 (926-1300, ext. 3277) (Or by appointment.) Voice mail messages can be left at this number, or you can e-mail me at clifford.orwin@utoronto.ca.

Course Assignments and Marking Scheme

POPOL 430Y (the undergraduate course). Four essays, one of 1375 words due Friday, October 18, three of 2750 words each, due November 22, January 24, and March 28; a take-home exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, March 21, due at 11 AM on Monday, March 24). The first essay will be worth 10% of the final mark, each of the following three will be worth 20%, the take-home exam will be worth 25%, and there will be 5% for participation.

POL 2021Y (the graduate course). Three essays, on topics of the student's own devising, due October 25, January 10, and April 18; a take-home exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, March 21, due at 11 AM on Monday, March 24; each assignment worth a fourth of the final mark. Essays must not exceed 5500 words and will not be read beyond the 5500th word. (There will be a much lower word limit for the take-home exam.)

PLEASE SUBMIT YOUR ESSAYS ELECTRONICALLY, THEREBY SPARING CANADA'S FORESTS.

N.B. In the graduate course as in the undergraduate one, no extensions will be granted on written work except for good cause. In keeping with Nietzsche's theory of punishment, however,

according to which every crime has its price and punishment was originally nothing more than an exaction of that price (cf. *On the Genealogy of Morals*, Second Essay), extensions will be readily available to those willing to purchase them. The price will be 3 points, plus 2 additional points per day beginning with the first, off your mark for that assignment. (If you

are one day late you will lose 5 points; two days late, 7; etc.). This proviso does not apply to the take-home exam, which will not be accepted if late.

You are responsible for informing yourself of and abiding by the University's policies on plagiarism and other academic offenses. These are available at the Department of Political Science or from the instructor.

MR ORWIN'S OFFICE HOURS

Wednesdays, 3:00-5:00, at Alumni Hall 323 (926-1300, ext. 3277) on even-dated Wednesdays and at Sidney Smith Hall 3055 (978-0747) on odd-dated ones. (Or by appointment.) Messages are better left at the first of these numbers, where I have voice mail.