

JRA 401/2321H1
State and Society in Post-Soviet Central Asia (Spring 2020)
Thursdays, 10 a.m. – noon, LA212

Edward Schatz, Associate Professor, Political Science
Office: 204N Munk (1 Devonshire Place)
ed.schatz@utoronto.ca
Office Hours: Thursdays, noon – 2 pm

ABOUT THE COURSE

More than 25 years after the Soviet collapse, Central Asia (and its neighbor Afghanistan) continue to see vexed relations between state and society. In this course, we ask: 1) What impact did Soviet-style modernization have and what are the legacies of that modernization project? 2) How have relations between society and state changed since 1991? 3) How do individuals and groups relate to the state? 4) What role do religion and ethnicity play in political and social life? 5) What are the primary axes for variation in the experiences of these six states (Afghanistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan)? This is a political science course, but about half of our readings are by anthropologists, historians, sociologists, and others.

Course objectives:

At the end of the course, you should be able to:

- Understand the impact of the Soviet period on Central Asia;
 - Describe key differences among Central Asian states and Afghanistan;
 - Appreciate the complex relationships between state and society in a “weak state” context;
 - Engage critically with scholarly literature on Central Asia and Afghanistan;
 - Advance some plausible arguments of your own regarding politics in Central Asia and Afghanistan.
-

Required course materials:

Course readings are available via the course Quercus site. Students are responsible for accessing these materials. Attendance in class is essential. The material from class discussion and material from readings are different. If you come to class and take notes, as well as read the course material carefully and take notes, you are likely to do well in the course.

Suggested course materials:

Unless you have already studied Central Asia, I recommend that you consult web-based resources, such as the CIA Factbook, for basic background information. If, as you read a

scholarly article, you find yourself needing to know what X refers to, by all means go online and do some searching. Of course, do this for factual information, not for matters that require more in-depth interpretation. For the latter, you should use scholarly sources.

Prerequisites:

Prerequisites are strictly checked and enforced and must be completed before taking a course. By taking this course you acknowledge that you will be removed from the course at any time if you do not meet all requirements. Further information can be found in the 2019-2020 Courses Calendar which is available from the Office of the Registrar.

ASSIGNMENTS

- Attendance: required
 - Participation: 20%
 - Presentations (2): 15%
 - Response to Film: 6%
 - Reaction papers: 6 x 4% = 24%
 - Term paper: initial research: 8%
 - Term paper: 27%
-

Attendance: expected

Your attendance is expected. If you miss a meeting, contact one of your peers for the notes that you missed. If you miss a class, you cannot receive participation marks for that class meeting.

Participation: 20%

Since this is a seminar, come ready for discussion! Be prepared: read the material, review your notes, and think in advance about what questions you might have. Active participation ensures that I won't have to guess what you know and how well you are engaging the material.

Presentations: 15%

Each student will give two (2) in-class presentations. The analytic presentation lasts 5-7 minutes and is worth 10% of your final mark. A top analytic presentation poses thoughtful ways to analyze the week's materials. It shows familiarity with the material but does **not** summarize readings. An analytic presentation that merely summarizes the readings will earn a maximum mark of "C." The presentation on additional readings lasts 4-5 minutes and is worth 5% of your final mark. A top presentation first briefly summarizes the additional readings assigned for the week before providing a clear thesis about how these additional readings improve our understanding of the topic. Sign-up sheets will be circulated at our first class meeting.

Response to Film: 6%

Write a response to the film “You are not an Orphan.” Your reaction should be 700-800 words (please provide a word count) and should offer a clear thesis, along with commentary, analysis, and/or questions about the film. Top marks are reserved for responses that demonstrate close familiarity with and serious thinking about the film. This is due on February 6 at 10 am, but I will accept—without penalty—submissions through February 13 at 10 am, after which I will accept no submissions. Submissions are via Quercus.

Reaction Papers: 6 x 4% = 24%

For each of six weeks, write a paper (400-600 words) in which you react to the week’s readings. A reaction can take many forms. For example, you might address some of the following:

- A) How does the week’s readings accord with or contradict readings from past weeks?
- B) Are the week’s readings persuasive? Why or why not? What about their use of evidence and/or logic is compelling? What is not compelling?
- C) What additional questions does the week’s readings spur in your mind? Why are they important questions to address?
- D) Are there current events from Central Asia that shed light on the week’s readings? Do aspects of the readings shed light on current events?
- E) Which comparative cases (i.e., from outside Central Asia) would be useful parallels for thinking about the issues from this week’s readings?

Each paper will be marked on a) how well it demonstrates your understanding of the readings, b) the coherence of the thesis, c) the creativity with which it addresses the material, and d) its use of evidence (from the week’s readings). Please use in-line parenthetical citations following the *Chicago Manual of Style*, which is available through the library’s website. Because these essays are short, your writing should be concise. Do not rely on lengthy quotes as “filler.”

How to submit

Choose any six weeks (except weeks 1 and 11). You may submit more than 6 reactions; I count the six highest marks. To receive credit, (1) ensure that the essay is on that week’s readings and (2) upload via Quercus by 10 pm the night before class. You do not need to supply a hard copy. I cannot accept late submissions for reaction papers. Be sure to plan ahead!

Term Paper: Initial Research: 8%

Choose a topic that is in the news concerning Central Asia. Find at least 20 substantial news articles on the topic from diverse sources. Write a concise report that a) summarizes the news developments in this area, b) highlights what we *do* know on the topic, and c) identifies what important matters we *do not* know on the topic. Your report should be about 1200-1500 words;

please provide a word-count). Due on February 27, 10 am, via Quercus. A penalty applies for late submissions (see below). Details will follow.

Term Paper: 27%

Choose a topic that is in the news concerning Central Asia. Write a concise report (2200-2800 words; provide a word-count) that, based on **scholarly** research on related/similar topics, gives scholarly depth to the news coverage of your topic. Top marks are reserved for papers that are well written, well researched, and offer a thesis that is clear, convincing, and innovative. Papers under 2000 words or over 3000 words are penalized a full letter grade. Due on April 2, 10 am via Quercus. A penalty applies for late submissions (see below). Details will follow.

COURSE POLICIES

Late Penalty

For the Term Paper Initial Research and the Term Paper, a penalty is 5% per day or fraction thereof (including weekends) of the total for the assignment. If you submit five or more calendar days late will be assigned a grade of zero. Accommodations due to late registration into the course will NOT be approved. To receive credit, upload your paper to via Quercus, which will record the submission date and time.

Late submissions for reaction papers are not accepted. Submissions of the Response to Film are not accepted beyond February 13, 10 am.

Accessibility

Students with diverse learning styles and needs are welcome. In particular, if you have a disability/health consideration that may require accommodations, feel free to approach me and/or the AccessAbility Resource Centre as soon as possible. AccessAbility staff (located in Rm 2037, Davis Building) are available by appointment to assess specific needs, provide referrals and arrange appropriate accommodations. Please call 905-569-4699 or email access.utm@utoronto.ca. The sooner you communicate your needs, the faster you might receive assistance in meeting your learning goals.

Notice of Collection

The University of Toronto respects your privacy. The information on medical certificates is collected pursuant to section 2(14) of the University of Toronto Act, 1971. It is collected for the purpose of administering accommodations for academic purposes based on medical grounds. The department will maintain a record of all medical certificates received. At all times it will be protected in accordance with the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act.

If you have questions, please refer to www.utoronto.ca/privacy or contact the University's Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Office at 416-946-5835. Address: Room 201, McMurrich Bldg., 12 Queen's Park Crescent, Toronto, ON, M5S 1A1.

Equity Statement

U of T is committed to equity and respect for diversity. All members of the learning environment in this course should strive to create an atmosphere of mutual respect. As a course instructor, I will neither condone nor tolerate behaviour that undermines the dignity or self-esteem of any individual and wish to be alerted to any attempt to create an intimidating or hostile environment. It is our collective responsibility to create a space that is inclusive and welcomes discussion. Discrimination, harassment and hate speech will not be tolerated. If you have any questions, comments, or concerns you may contact the U of T Equity and Diversity officer.

Plagiarism

Plagiarism is the presentation of someone else's work as your own. This could include direct quotations from sources that you do not properly cite or presenting someone else's work as your own. Even omitting quotation marks for verbatim quotes is an academic offence. Material from the internet is subject to the same citation requirements as any other material. If you are unsure what constitutes plagiarism or how to cite properly, talk to your tutorial leader or the professor. You should also refer to <http://www.writing.utoronto.ca/advice/using-sources/how-not-to-plagiarize>. Penalties for plagiarism will be dealt with by the department and university. For further information, consult the last page of this syllabus.

Turnitin.com

This course uses Turnitin.com, a web-based program to deter plagiarism. Students agree that by taking this course all required papers may be subject to submission for textual similarity review to Turnitin.com for the detection of plagiarism. All submitted papers will be included as source documents in the Turnitin.com reference database solely for the purpose of detecting plagiarism of such papers. The terms that apply to the University's use of Turnitin.com are described on the Turnitin.com web site.

Email Policy

Consult the syllabus and other course information before sending email. If you have a simple question, send a message. If you do not receive a reply within 3 days, please resend. Email is great, but extended conversations are conducted face to face.

Extensions, Missed Work, Emergencies

Sometimes extraordinary circumstances justify an extension. I discuss possible extensions during office hours, not via email. I consider such circumstances only until 2 weeks before the due date. After that, I discuss extensions only if you have an official note from a doctor or the University.

If, due to a bona-fide emergency, you miss an assignment you must: 1) contact me within 48 hours with a complete explanation, and 2) provide official documentation. I consider requests on an individual basis; in some cases, I authorize make-up assignments, in other cases I do not. If an illness or other event interferes with your ability to complete your work on schedule, you need to provide official documentation. If you are truly incapacitated, your documentation must show this. I scrutinize the documentation to see how *long* of an extension, if any, is warranted, based on the severity and duration of your incapacitation.

COURSE OUTLINE

Week 1 (January 9): Introduction

Week 2 (January 16): The Onset of Soviet Power

- Jeff Sahadeo, "Epidemic and Empire: Ethnicity, Class, and 'Civilization' in the 1892 Tashkent Cholera Riot," *Slavic Review* 64(1), 2005: 117-39
- Niccolò Pianciola and Paolo Sartori, "Waqf in Turkestan: The Colonial Legacy and the Fate of an Islamic Institution in Early Soviet Central Asia, 1917–1924," *Central Asian Survey* 26(4), 2007: 475-498
- Yuri Slezkine, "The USSR as a Communal Apartment, or How a Socialist State Promoted Ethnic Particularism," *Slavic Review* 53(2), 1994: 414-452
- Jennifer Brick Murtazashvili, *Informal order and the state in Afghanistan*. Cambridge University Press, 2016, chapter 1.

Additional

- Keith Darden and Anna Grzymala-Busse, "The Great Divide: Literacy, Nationalism, and the Communist Collapse," *World Politics* 59(1), 2006: 83-115
- Francine Hirsch, "Towards an Empire of Nations: Border-Making and the Formation of 'Soviet' National Identities," *Russian Review*, 59(2), 2000: 201-26
- Botagoz Kassymbekova, "An Empire of Liars," in her *Despite Cultures: Early Soviet Rule in Tajikistan*. University of Pittsburgh Press, pp. 160-178
- Alun Thomas, "The Caspian Disputes: Nationalism and Nomadism in Early Soviet Central Asia," *The Russian Review* 76(3), 2017: 502-25

Week 3 (January 23): Soviet Rule I (Visitor: Professor Jeff Sahadeo)

- Eren Tasar, "Islamically Informed Soviet Patriotism in Postwar Kyrgyzstan," *Cahiers du monde russe* 52(2), 2012: 387-404
- Jeff Sahadeo, excerpts from his *Voices from the Soviet Edge* (Cornell UP, 2019)
- Adrienne Edgar, "Bolshevism, Patriarchy, and the Nation: The Soviet 'Emancipation' of Muslim Women in Pan-Islamic Perspective," *Slavic Review* 65(2), 2006: 252-272

Additional

- Steven Sabol, "The Creation of Soviet Central Asia: the 1924 National Delimitation," *Central Asian Survey* 4(2), 1995: 225-41
- Stephane A. Dudoignon, "From revival to mutation: the religious personnel of Islam in Tajikistan, from de-Stalinization to independence (1955–91)," *Central Asian Survey* 30(1), 2011: 53-80
- Isaac Scarborough, "(Over) determining social disorder: Tajikistan and the economic collapse of perestroika," *Central Asian Survey* 35(3), 2016: 1-25.

Week 4 (January 30): Soviet Rule II

In-class film screening: "You are not an Orphan"

- Adeeb Khalid, "Ulama and the State in Uzbekistan," *Asian Journal of Social Science*, 42(5), 2014: 517-35
- Kalinovsky, Artemy M. *Laboratory of socialist development: Cold War politics and decolonization in Soviet Tajikistan*. Cornell University Press, 2018. Excerpts TBA

Week 5 (February 6): Afghanistan

Submit Review of "You are not an Orphan" by 10 am via Quercus

- Jennifer Brick Murtazashvili, *Informal order and the state in Afghanistan*. Cambridge University Press, 2016, chapter 2
- Thomas Barfield, "Problems in establishing legitimacy in Afghanistan," *Iranian Studies* 37(2), 2004: 263-93
- Thomas Barfield, "Culture and Custom in Nation-Building: Law in Afghanistan," *Maine Law Review* 60(2), 2008: 348–73

Additional

- Andreas Wilde and Katja Mielke, "Order, stability, and change in Afghanistan: from top-down to bottom-up state-making," *Central Asian Survey* 32(3), 2013: 353-70
- Kristian Berg Harpviken, "Transcending Traditionalism: The Emergence of Non-State Military Formations in Afghanistan," *Journal of Peace Research* 34, August 1997: 271-87
- Noah Coburn, *Bazaar politics: power and pottery in an Afghan market town*. Stanford University Press, 2011
- Aisha Ahmad, "Going Global: Islamist Competition in Contemporary Civil Wars," *Security Studies* 25(2), 2016: 353-384.
- Thomas Risse and Ursula Lehmkuhl, "Governance in areas of limited statehood," *The Oxford handbook of governance* 2012: 699-715.

Week 6 (February 13): Soviet Legacies

- Stephen Kotkin and Mark R. Beissinger, "The Historical Legacies of Communism: An Empirical Agenda," in Stephen Kotkin and Mark R. Beissinger, eds., *Historical Legacies of Communism in Russia and Eastern Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015, pp. 1-27

- Anna Grzymala-Busse and Pauline Jones Luong. “Reconceptualizing the state: lessons from post-communism,” *Politics & Society* 30(4), 2002: 529-554
- Annette Bohr, “The Central Asian states as nationalising regimes,” in Graham Smith, Vivien Law, Andrew Wilson, Annette Bohr, and Edward Allworth, *Nation-building in the post-Soviet borderlands: the politics of national identities*, 1998. Cambridge University Press, pp. 139-166.

Additional

- Anastassia Obydenkova and Alexander Libman, “Understanding the Survival of Post-Communist Corruption in Contemporary Russia: The Influence of Historical Legacies,” *Post-Soviet Affairs* 31(4), 2015: 304-38.
- Juan Ri Cole and Deniz Kandiyoti, “Nationalism and the colonial legacy in the Middle East and Central Asia: Introduction,” *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 34(2), 2002: 189-203.
- Ibañez-Tirado, Diana, “‘How can I be post-Soviet if I was never Soviet?’ Rethinking categories of time and social change—a perspective from Kulob, southern Tajikistan,” *Central Asian Survey* 34(2), 2015: 190-203.

February 20: Reading Week

Week 7 (February 27): Islam, State, and Society

Term paper initial research due by 10 am via Quercus

- Eric McGlinchey, “Divided Faith: Trapped between State and Islam in Uzbekistan,” in Jeff Sahadeo and Russell Zanca, eds., *Everyday Life in Central Asia*, Indiana UP, 2007
- Thomas Barfield, “An Islamic State Is a State Run by Good Muslims: Religion as a Way of Life and Not an Ideology in Afghanistan,” in Robert W. Hefner, ed., *Remaking Muslim Politics: Pluralism, Contestation, Democratization*, Princeton University Press, 2004, pp. 213–39
- David W. Montgomery and John Heathershaw. “Islam, secularism and danger: a reconsideration of the link between religiosity, radicalism and rebellion in Central Asia,” *Religion, State & Society* 44(3), 2016: 192-218.
- Ashraf Ghani, "Islam and State-Building in a Tribal Society Afghanistan: 1880—1901." *Modern Asian Studies* 12, no. 2 (1978): 269-284.

Additional

- Schwedler, Jillian. "Can Islamists become moderates? Rethinking the inclusion-moderation hypothesis." *World Politics* 63(2), 2011: 347-376.
- Lemon, Edward, and Hélène Thibault. "Counter-extremism, power and authoritarian governance in Tajikistan." *Central Asian Survey* 2017: 1-23.
- Berna Turam, “A Bargain Between the Secular State and Turkish Islam: Politics of Ethnicity in Central Asia,” *Nations and Nationalism* 10(3), 2004: 353-374
- Martha Brill Olcott, “Religion and State Policy In Central Asia.” *The Review of Faith & International Affairs* 12(4): 2014: 1-15
- Alisher Khamidov, “The Taming of the Sacred: How ‘Weak’ State Structures Regulate Religion in Uzbekistan,” in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017

Week 8 (March 5): State Building and Nation Building

- Jesse Driscoll, "Consolidating a Weak State after Civil War: A Tajik Fable," in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017
- Filippo Menga, "Building a nation through a dam: the case of Rogun in Tajikistan," *Nationalities Papers* 43(3), 2015: 479-494.
- Michele E. Commercio, "The Politics and Economics of 'Retraditionalization' in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan." *Post-Soviet Affairs* 2014: 1-28
- Jennifer Brick Murtazashvili, *Informal order and the state in Afghanistan*. Cambridge University Press, 2016, chapter 7.

Additional

- Rogers Brubaker, "Nationalizing states revisited: projects and processes of nationalization in post-Soviet states," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 34(11), 2011: 1785-1814.
- Erica Marat, "Nation Branding in Central Asia: a New Campaign to Present Ideas about the State and the Nation," *Europe-Asia Studies* 61(7), 2009: 1123-1136
- John Heathershaw, "Peacebuilding as Practice: Discourses from Post-Conflict Tajikistan." *International Peacekeeping* 14(2), 2007: 219-36
- Bhavna Dave, "Entitlement through numbers: nationality and language categories in the first post-Soviet census of Kazakhstan," *Nations and Nationalism* 10(4), 2004: 439-459.
- Kudaibergenova, Diana. "The Archaeology of Nationalizing Regimes in the Post-Soviet Space: Narratives, Elites, and Minorities." *Problems of Post-Communism* 64(6), 2017: 342-55
- Johan Engvall, "License to Seek Rents: 'Corruption' as a Method of Post-Soviet Governance," in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017.

Week 9 (March 12): Regime and Society

- Edward Schatz, "The Soft Authoritarian 'Tool Kit': Agenda-Setting Power in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan," *Comparative Politics*, 2009: 203-22
- Aksana Ismailbekova, "Performing Democracy: State-Making through Patronage in Kyrgyzstan," in Madeleine Reeves, Johan Rasanayagam, and Judith Beyer, eds. *Ethnographies of the state in Central Asia: Performing Politics*. Indiana University Press, 2014, pp. 78-98
- Scott Radnitz, "The Color of Money: Privatization, Economic Dispersion, and the Post-Soviet Revolutions," *Comparative Politics* 42(2), 2010: 127-146

Additional

- Charles J. Sullivan. 2015. "Civil Society in Chains: The Dynamics of Sociopolitical Relations in Turkmenistan," in Charles E. Ziegler, ed., *Civil Society and Politics in Central Asia*. University Press of Kentucky, pp. 249-275
- Reuel R. Hanks, "Narratives of Islam in Uzbekistan: authoritarian myths and the Janus-state syndrome," *Central Asian Survey* 35(4), 2016: 501-513

- Roberts, Sean R. "Doing the Democracy Dance in Kazakhstan: Democracy Development as Cultural Encounter." *Slavic Review* 71(2), 2012: 308-330
- Elena Maltseva, "Cracks in the System: What Does the Zhanaozen Incident Tell Us about Regime Stability in Kazakhstan?" in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017
- David Lewis, "Blogging Zhanaozen: hegemonic discourse and authoritarian resilience in Kazakhstan," *Central Asian Survey* 2016: 1-18.
- Slater, Dan. "Democratic careening." *World Politics* 65(4), 2013: 729-763
- Erica Marat, "Reforming Police in Post-Communist Countries: International Effects, Domestic Heroes," *Comparative Politics* 48, no. 3 (2016): 333-352.

Week 10 (March 19): Memory and Identity (Visitor: Professor Sarah Cameron)

- Cynthia Werner and Kathleen Purvis-Roberts, "Cold War Memories and Post-Cold War Realities: The Politics of Memory and Identity in the Everyday Life of Kazakhstan's Radiation Victims," in Madeleine Reeves, Johan Rasanayagam, and Judith Beyer, eds. *Ethnographies of the state in Central Asia: Performing Politics*. Indiana University Press, 2014, pp. 285-310
- Sarah Cameron, *The Hungry Steppe*, excerpts

Week 11 (March 26): NO CLASS MEETING

Week 12 (April 2): The Future of the Central Asian State

Term paper due by 10 am via Quercus

- Johan Engvall, "License to Seek Rents: 'Corruption' as a Method of Post-Soviet Governance," in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017
- Madeleine Reeves, "The Ashar-State: Communal Commitment and State Elicitation in Rural Kyrgyzstan," in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017
- Alexander Cooley and John Heathershaw, "Introduction," in their *Dictators without Borders*, Yale University Press
- Murtazashvili, Jennifer. "A Tired Cliche: Why We Should Stop Worrying about Ungoverned Spaces and Embrace Self-Governance." *Journal of International Affairs* 71, no. 2 (2018): 11-29.

Additional

- Rano Turaeva, "Imagined mosque communities in Russia: Central Asian migrants in Moscow." *Asian Ethnicity* 20(2), 2019: 131-147
- Erica Marat, "Post-violence regime survival and expansion in Kazakhstan and Tajikistan," *Central Asian Survey* 35(4), 2016: 531-548.
- Charles E. Ziegler, "Great powers, civil society and authoritarian diffusion in Central Asia," *Central Asian Survey* 35(4), 2016: 549-569.
- Mariya Y. Omelicheva, "Authoritarian legitimation: assessing discourses of legitimacy in Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan," *Central Asian Survey* 35(4), 2016: 481-500.