

Edward Schatz, Associate Professor, Political Science

[ed.schatz@utoronto.ca](mailto:ed.schatz@utoronto.ca)

Office Hours: Wednesdays 10-12, 320N Munk (1 Devonshire Place)

## **POL 492/2392**

### **State and Society in Central Asia and Afghanistan**

Wednesdays, 2-4 pm

LA213

More than 25 years after the collapse of the Soviet state, Central Asia (and its neighbour Afghanistan) continue to see vexed relations between state and society. In this course, we ask: 1) What impact did Soviet-style modernization have and what are the legacies of that modernization project? 2) How have relations between society and state changed since 1991? 3) How do individuals and groups relate to the state? 4) What role do religion and ethnicity play in political and social life? 5) What are the primary axes for variation in the experiences of these six states (Afghanistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan)? Although this is a political science course, about half of our readings are by anthropologists, historians, sociologists, and others.

#### **Books**

Available at the Bob Miller Book Room (180 Bloor Street West, Lower Level, 416-922-3557):

- Eric McGlinchey, *Chaos, Violence, Dynasty: Politics and Islam in Central Asia*, Pittsburgh, 2012
- Noah Coburn, *Bazaar Politics*, Stanford, 2011

#### **Requirements**

*Participation (15%)*. Since this is a seminar, come ready to discuss the material. Active participation ensures that I won't have to guess what you know and how engaged you are with the material.

*Presentations (15%)*. Each student will give two (2) in-class presentations during the term. The analytic presentation lasts 5-7 minutes and is worth 10% of your final mark. A top analytic presentation poses thoughtful ways to analyze the week's materials. It shows familiarity with the material but does **not** summarize readings. An analytic presentation that merely summarizes the readings will earn a maximum mark of "C." The presentation on additional readings lasts 4-5 minutes and is worth 5% of your final mark. A top presentation first briefly summarizes the additional readings assigned for the week before providing a clear thesis about how these additional readings improve our understanding of the topic. A sign-up sheet for both presentations will be circulated during our first class meeting.

*Response to Film (5%)*. Write a response to the film "The Speaker." Your reaction should be 400-500 words (please provide a word count) and should offer a clear thesis, along with commentary, analysis, and/or questions about the film. Top marks are reserved for responses that demonstrate close familiarity with and serious thinking about the film. This is due on January 24, but I will accept—without penalty—submissions through February 7, after which I will accept no submissions. Submissions are via turnitin.com.

*Pause-and-Think Papers (30%)*: Students will write two (2) papers that encourage thinking across the weeks' topics. For each, a) choose any two weeks (excluding the week of your analytic presentation and week 10), b) read and re-read all the material for those two weeks, including the additional readings, c) write a 1200-1400-word (please provide a word count) paper in which you creatively put the two sets of readings into conversation with each other. (The second paper must cover weeks that are different from the first paper.) Top marks are reserved for papers that are well written, demonstrate a thorough and comprehensive understanding of the

material, and advance a well substantiated and creative thesis that links the disparate readings. The first paper is due on February 14. The second paper is due on March 28. Late submissions are penalized a flat 15%, whether they are 7 minutes or 7 days late, after which I accept no further submissions. Submissions are via turnitin.com. Details will follow.

*Term Paper (35%):* Choose a topic that is in the news concerning Central Asia. Write a concise report (2200-2800 words; provide a word-count) that, based on **scholarly** research on related/similar topics, gives scholarly depth to the news coverage of your topic. Top marks are reserved for papers that are well written, well researched, and offer a thesis that is clear, convincing, and innovative. Papers under 2000 words or over 3000 words are penalized a full letter grade. Due on April 4. Late submissions are penalized a flat 15%, whether 7 minutes or 7 days late, after which I accept no further submissions. Submissions are via turnitin.com. Details will follow.

## **Course Policies**

*Office hours:* No appointment is needed. If you cannot make office hours but would like to meet, email me to schedule a mutually agreeable time.

*Email:* Consult the syllabus and other course information before sending email. If you have a simple question, send a message. If you do not receive a reply within 3 days, please resend. Email is great, but extended conversations are conducted face to face.

*Keep copies:* Keep draft work and hard copies of all assignments until the marked versions are returned.

*Late penalties:* Your review of the film may be submitted up to two weeks after the due date without penalty; I will not accept submissions after that. All other papers, if late, are penalized a flat 15% of possible marks; no paper is accepted more than 7 days late.

*Plagiarism:* Plagiarism is a serious academic offence and will be dealt with accordingly. For further clarification and information, please see the University of Toronto's policy on Plagiarism at <http://www.utoronto.ca/writing/plagsep.html>. This course uses Turnitin.com, a web-based program to deter plagiarism. Students agree that by taking this course all required papers may be subject to submission for textual similarity review to Turnitin.com for the detection of plagiarism. All submitted papers will be included as source documents in the Turnitin.com reference database solely for the purpose of detecting plagiarism of such papers. The terms that apply to the University's use of Turnitin.com are described on the Turnitin.com web site.

*Extensions:* Sometimes extraordinary circumstances justify an extension. I discuss possible extensions during office hours, not via email. I consider such circumstances only until 2 weeks before the due date. After that, I discuss extensions only if a student has an official note from a doctor or from the University.

*Missed Assignments:* If, due to a bona-fide emergency, you miss an assignment you must: 1) contact me within 48 hours with a complete explanation, and 2) provide official documentation. I consider the your request on an individual basis; in some cases, I authorize make-up assignments, in other cases I do not.

*Medical or Other Documentation:* If an illness or other event interferes with your ability to complete your work on schedule, you need to provide official documentation. If you are truly incapacitated, your documentation must show this. I scrutinize the documentation to see how *long* of an extension, if any, is warranted, based on the severity and duration of your incapacitation.

*Accessibility Needs:* The University of Toronto is committed to accessibility. If you require accommodations or have any accessibility concerns, visit <http://studentlife.utoronto.ca/accessibility> as soon as possible.

*Notice of Collection:* The U. of Toronto respects your privacy. The information on medical certificates is collected pursuant to section 2(14) of the University of Toronto Act, 1971. It is collected for the purpose of administering accommodations for academic purposes based on medical grounds. The department will maintain a record of all medical certificates received. At all times it will be protected in accordance with the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act. If you have questions, please refer to [www.utoronto.ca/privacy](http://www.utoronto.ca/privacy) or contact the University's Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Office at 416-946-5835. Room 201, McMurrich Bldg., 12 Queen's Park Crescent, Toronto, ON, M5S 1A1.

## **Equity Statement**

The University of Toronto is committed to equity and respect for diversity. All members of the learning environment in this course should strive to create an atmosphere of mutual respect. As a course instructor, I will neither condone nor tolerate behaviour that undermines the dignity or self-esteem of any individual in this course and wish to be alerted to any attempt to create an intimidating or hostile environment. It is our collective responsibility to create a space that is inclusive and welcomes discussion. Discrimination, harassment and hate speech will not be tolerated. If you have any questions, comments, or concerns you may contact the U of T Equity and Diversity officer.

## **Course Outline**

### **Week 1 (January 10): Introduction**

### **Week 2 (January 17): The Onset of Soviet Power**

- Niccolò Pianciola and Paolo Sartori, "Waqf in Turkestan: The Colonial Legacy and the Fate of an Islamic Institution in Early Soviet Central Asia, 1917–1924," *Central Asian Survey* 26(4), 2007: 475-498
- Jeff Sahadeo, "Epidemic and Empire: Ethnicity, Class, and 'Civilization' in the 1892 Tashkent Cholera Riot," *Slavic Review* 64(1), 2005: 117-39
- Yuri Slezkine, "The USSR as a Communal Apartment, or How a Socialist State Promoted Ethnic Particularism," *Slavic Review* 53(2), 1994: 414-452

#### Additional

- Keith Darden and Anna Grzymala-Busse, "The Great Divide: Literacy, Nationalism, and the Communist Collapse," *World Politics* 59(1), 2006: 83-115
- Francine Hirsch, "Towards an Empire of Nations: Border-Making and the Formation of 'Soviet' National Identities," *Russian Review*, 59(2), 2000: 201-26
- Botagoz Kassymbekova, "An Empire of Liars," in her *Despite Cultures: Early Soviet Rule in Tajikistan*. University of Pittsburgh Press, pp. 160-178
- Alun Thomas, "The Caspian Disputes: Nationalism and Nomadism in Early Soviet Central Asia," *The Russian Review* 76(3), 2017: 502-25

### **Week 3 (January 24): Soviet Period**

- *Submit Review of "The Speaker" by 11:59 pm via Turnitin.com*
- Steven Sabol, "The Creation of Soviet Central Asia: the 1924 National Delimitation," *Central Asian Survey* 4(2), 1995: 225-41

- Adrienne Edgar, “Bolshevism, Patriarchy, and the Nation: The Soviet ‘Emancipation’ of Muslim Women in Pan-Islamic Perspective,” *Slavic Review* 65(2), 2006: 252-272
- Eren Tasar, “Islamically Informed Soviet Patriotism in Postwar Kyrgyzstan,” *Cahiers du monde russe* 52(2), 2012: 387-404
- Adeeb Khalid, “Ulama and the State in Uzbekistan,” *Asian Journal of Social Science*, 42(5), 2014: 517-35

#### Additional

- Cynthia Werner and Kathleen Purvis-Roberts, “Cold War Memories and Post-Cold War Realities: The Politics of Memory and Identity in the Everyday Life of Kazakhstan’s Radiation Victims,” in Madeleine Reeves, Johan Rasanayagam, and Judith Beyer, eds. *Ethnographies of the state in Central Asia: Performing Politics*. Indiana University Press, 2014, pp. 285-310
- Stephane A. Dudoignon, “From revival to mutation: the religious personnel of Islam in Tajikistan, from de-Stalinization to independence (1955–91),” *Central Asian Survey* 30(1), 2011: 53-80
- Isaac Scarborough, “(Over) determining social disorder: Tajikistan and the economic collapse of perestroika,” *Central Asian Survey* 35(3), 2016: 1-25.

#### **Week 4 (January 31): Soviet Legacies**

- Stephen Kotkin and Mark R. Beissinger, “The Historical Legacies of Communism: An Empirical Agenda,” in Stephen Kotkin and Mark R. Beissinger, eds., *Historical Legacies of Communism in Russia and Eastern Europe*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015, pp. 1-27
- McGlinchey, Introduction
- Anna Grzymala-Busse and Pauline Jones Luong. “Reconceptualizing the state: lessons from post-communism,” *Politics & Society* 30(4), 2002: 529-554
- Annette Bohr, “The Central Asian states as nationalising regimes,” in Graham Smith, Vivien Law, Andrew Wilson, Annette Bohr, and Edward Allworth, *Nation-building in the post-Soviet borderlands: the politics of national identities*, 1998. Cambridge University Press, pp. 139-166.

#### Additional

- Anastassia Obydenkova and Alexander Libman, “Understanding the Survival of Post-Communist Corruption in Contemporary Russia: The Influence of Historical Legacies,” *Post-Soviet Affairs* 31(4), 2015: 304-38.
- Juan Ri Cole and Deniz Kandiyoti, “Nationalism and the colonial legacy in the Middle East and Central Asia: Introduction,” *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 34(2), 2002: 189-203.
- Ibañez-Tirado, Diana, “‘How can I be post-Soviet if I was never Soviet?’ Rethinking categories of time and social change—a perspective from Kulob, southern Tajikistan,” *Central Asian Survey* 34(2), 2015: 190-203.

#### **Week 5 (February 7): Islam, State, and Society**

- Eric McGlinchey, “Divided Faith: Trapped between State and Islam in Uzbekistan,” in Jeff Sahadeo and Russell Zanca, eds., *Everyday Life in Central Asia*, Indiana UP, 2007
- Thomas Barfield, “An Islamic State Is a State Run by Good Muslims: Religion as a Way of Life and Not an Ideology in Afghanistan,” in Robert W. Hefner, ed., *Remaking Muslim Politics: Pluralism, Contestation, Democratization*, Princeton University Press, 2004, pp. 213–39
- Schwedler, Jillian. "Can Islamists become moderates? Rethinking the inclusion-moderation hypothesis." *World Politics* 63(2), 2011: 347-376.
- David W. Montgomery and John Heathershaw. “Islam, secularism and danger: a reconsideration of the link between religiosity, radicalism and rebellion in Central Asia,” *Religion, State & Society* 44(3), 2016: 192-218.

#### Additional

- Lemon, Edward, and Hélène Thibault. "Counter-extremism, power and authoritarian governance in Tajikistan." *Central Asian Survey* 2017: 1-23.
- Berna Turam, “A Bargain Between the Secular State and Turkish Islam: Politics of Ethnicity in Central Asia,” *Nations and Nationalism* 10(3), 2004: 353-374

- Martha Brill Olcott, "Religion and State Policy In Central Asia." *The Review of Faith & International Affairs* 12(4): 2014: 1-15
- Alisher Khamidov, "The Taming of the Sacred: How 'Weak' State Structures Regulate Religion in Uzbekistan," in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017

### **Week 6 (February 14): State Building and Nation Building**

- *Pause-and-Think Paper due by 11:59 pm via turnitin.com*
- Jesse Driscoll, "Consolidating a Weak State after Civil War: A Tajik Fable," in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017
- Rogers Brubaker, "Nationalizing states revisited: projects and processes of nationalization in post-Soviet states," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 34(11), 2011: 1785-1814.
- Filippo Menga, "Building a nation through a dam: the case of Rogun in Tajikistan," *Nationalities Papers* 43(3), 2015: 479-494.
- Michele E. Commercio, "The Politics and Economics of 'Retraditionalization' in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan." *Post-Soviet Affairs* 2014: 1-28

#### Additional

- Erica Marat, "Nation Branding in Central Asia: a New Campaign to Present Ideas about the State and the Nation," *Europe-Asia Studies* 61(7), 2009: 1123-1136
- John Heathershaw, "Peacebuilding as Practice: Discourses from Post-Conflict Tajikistan." *International Peacekeeping* 14(2), 2007: 219-36
- Bhavna Dave, "Entitlement through numbers: nationality and language categories in the first post-Soviet census of Kazakhstan," *Nations and Nationalism* 10(4), 2004: 439-459.
- Kudaibergenova, Diana T. "The Archaeology of Nationalizing Regimes in the Post-Soviet Space: Narratives, Elites, and Minorities." *Problems of Post-Communism* 64(6), 2017: 342-355

### **Week 7 (February 21): READING WEEK**

### **Week 8 (February 28): Regime and Society**

- McGlinchey, chapter on Kazakhstan
- Edward Schatz, "The Soft Authoritarian 'Tool Kit': Agenda-Setting Power in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan," *Comparative Politics*, 2009: 203-22
- Kelly M. McMann, "Market Reform as a Stimulus to Particularistic Politics," *Comparative Political Studies* 42(7): 2009: 971-994
- Aksana Ismailbekova, "Performing Democracy: State-Making through Patronage in Kyrgyzstan," in Madeleine Reeves, Johan Rasanayagam, and Judith Beyer, eds. *Ethnographies of the state in Central Asia: Performing Politics*. Indiana University Press, 2014, pp. 78-98

#### Additional

- Charles J. Sullivan. 2015. "Civil Society in Chains: The Dynamics of Sociopolitical Relations in Turkmenistan," in Charles E. Ziegler, ed., *Civil Society and Politics in Central Asia*. University Press of Kentucky, pp. 249-275
- Reuel R. Hanks, "Narratives of Islam in Uzbekistan: authoritarian myths and the Janus-state syndrome," *Central Asian Survey* 35(4), 2016: 501-513
- Roberts, Sean R. "Doing the Democracy Dance in Kazakhstan: Democracy Development as Cultural Encounter." *Slavic Review* 71(2), 2012: 308-330

### **Week 9 (March 7): Regime Durability (and Change)**

- McGlinchey, chapter on Kyrgyzstan and chapter on Uzbekistan
- "An Uzbek Spring has Sprung, but Summer is Still a Long Way Off," *The Economist*, 14 December 2017:

<https://www.economist.com/news/asia/21732574-new-president-less-brutal-his-predecessor-no-democrat-uzbek-spring-has-sprung>

- Scott Radnitz, "The Color of Money: Privatization, Economic Dispersion, and the Post-Soviet Revolutions," *Comparative Politics* 42(2), 2010: 127-146
- Elena Maltseva, "Cracks in the System: What Does the Zhanaozen Incident Tell Us about Regime Stability in Kazakhstan?" in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017

Additional

- David Lewis, "Blogging Zhanaozen: hegemonic discourse and authoritarian resilience in Kazakhstan," *Central Asian Survey* 2016: 1-18.
- Jennifer Murtazashvili, "Coloured by revolution: the political economy of autocratic stability in Uzbekistan." *Democratization* 19(1), 2012: 78-97
- Slater, Dan. "Democratic careening." *World Politics* 65(4), 2013: 729-763.

#### **Week 10 (March 14): In-Class Film Screening, Title TBA**

- Edward Schatz, "Transnational Image Making and Soft Authoritarian Kazakhstan," *Slavic Review* 67(1): 2008: 50-62
- Erica Marat, "Nation branding in Central Asia: a new campaign to present ideas about the state and the nation," *Europe-Asia Studies* 61(7), 2009: 1123-1136.
- One more reading, TBA

#### **Week 11 (March 21): Afghanistan I**

- Murtazashvili, Jennifer Brick. *Informal order and the state in Afghanistan*. Cambridge University Press, 2016, excerpts TBA
- Thomas Barfield, "Problems in establishing legitimacy in Afghanistan," *Iranian Studies* 37(2), 2004: 263-93
- Thomas Barfield, "Culture and Custom in Nation-Building: Law in Afghanistan," *Maine Law Review* 60(2), 2008: 348-73

Additional

- Andreas Wilde and Katja Mielke, "Order, stability, and change in Afghanistan: from top-down to bottom-up state-making," *Central Asian Survey* 32(3), 2013: 353-70
- Kristian Berg Harpviken, "Transcending Traditionalism: The Emergence of Non-State Military Formations in Afghanistan," *Journal of Peace Research* 34, August 1997: 271-87

#### **Week 12 (March 28): Afghanistan II**

- *Pause-and-Think Paper due by 11:59 pm* via turnitin.com
- Coburn, entire book

Additional

- Aisha Ahmad, "Going Global: Islamist Competition in Contemporary Civil Wars," *Security Studies* 25(2), 2016: 353-384.
- Thomas Risse and Ursula Lehmkuhl, "Governance in areas of limited statehood," *The Oxford handbook of governance* 2012: 699-715.

#### **Week 13 (April 4): How do Central Asian States Work? Final Reflections**

- *Term paper due by 11:59 pm* via turnitin.com
- Johan Engvall, "License to Seek Rents: 'Corruption' as a Method of Post-Soviet Governance," in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017
- Madeleine Reeves, "The Ashar-State: Communal Commitment and State Elicitation in Rural Kyrgyzstan," in Edward Schatz and John Heathershaw, eds., *Paradox of Power: Logics of State Weakness in Eurasia*. Pittsburgh:

University of Pittsburgh Press, 2017

- Alexander Cooley and John Heathershaw, "Introduction," in their *Dictators without Borders*. Forthcoming, Yale University Press
- Lawrence P. Markowitz, "Rural economies and leadership change in Central Asia," *Central Asian Survey* 2016: 1-17.

#### Additional

- Erica Marat, "Post-violence regime survival and expansion in Kazakhstan and Tajikistan," *Central Asian Survey* 35(4), 2016: 531-548.
- Charles E. Ziegler, "Great powers, civil society and authoritarian diffusion in Central Asia," *Central Asian Survey* 35(4), 2016: 549-569.
- Mariya Y. Omelicheva, "Authoritarian legitimation: assessing discourses of legitimacy in Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan," *Central Asian Survey* 35(4), 2016: 481-500.