

Edward Schatz, Associate Professor, Political Science

[ed.schatz@utoronto.ca](mailto:ed.schatz@utoronto.ca)

Office Hours: Wednesdays 10-12, 320N Munk (1 Devonshire Place)

## **POL 492/2392**

### **State and Society in Central Asia and Afghanistan**

Wednesdays, 2-4 pm

UC255

Almost 25 years after the collapse of the Soviet state, Central Asia (and its neighbour Afghanistan) continue to see vexed relations between state and society. In this course, we ask: 1) What impact did Soviet-style modernization have and what are the legacies of that modernization project? 2) How have relations between society and state changed since 1991? 3) How do individuals and groups relate to the state? 4) What role do religion and ethnicity play in political and social life? 5) What are the primary axes for variation in the experiences of these six states (Afghanistan, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan)? Although this is a political science course, about half of our readings are by anthropologists, historians, sociologists, and others.

#### **Books**

Available at the Bob Miller Book Room (180 Bloor Street W., Lower Level, 416-922-3557):

- Madeleine Reeves, Johan Rasayanagam, and Judith Beyer, eds. *Ethnographies of the State in Central Asia: Performing Politics*. Indiana UP, 2013
- Eric McGlinchey, *Chaos, Violence, Dynasty: Politics and Islam in Central Asia*, Pittsburgh, 2012
- Noah Coburn, *Bazaar Politics*, Stanford UP, 2011

#### **Requirements**

*Participation (15%)*. Since this is a seminar, come ready to discuss the material. Active participation ensures that I won't have to guess what you know and how engaged you are with the material.

*Presentations (15%)*. Each student will give two (2) in-class presentations during the term. The analytic presentation lasts 5-7 minutes and is worth 10% of your final mark. A top analytic presentation poses thoughtful ways to analyze the week's materials. It shows familiarity with the material but does **not** summarize readings. An analytic presentation that merely summarizes the readings will earn a maximum mark of "C." The presentation on additional readings lasts 4-5 minutes and is worth 5% of your final mark. A top presentation first briefly summarizes the additional readings assigned for the week before providing a clear thesis about how these additional readings improve our understanding of the topic. A sign-up sheet for both presentations will be circulated during our first class meeting.

*Response to Film (5%)*. Write a response to the film "The Orator." Your reaction should be 400-500 words (please provide a word count) and should offer a clear thesis, along with commentary, analysis, and/or questions about the film. Top marks are reserved for responses that demonstrate close familiarity with and serious thinking about the film. This is due on January 27, but I will accept—without penalty—submissions through February 10, after which I will accept no submissions. Submissions are via turnitin.com.

*Pause-and-Think Papers (30%)*: Students will write two (2) papers that encourage thinking across the weeks' topics. For each, a) choose any two weeks (excluding week 1, the week of your analytic

presentation, and week 13), b) read and re-read all the material for those two weeks, including the additional readings, c) write a 1200-1400-word (please provide a word count) paper in which you creatively put the two sets of readings into conversation with each other. (The second paper must cover weeks that are different from the first paper.) Top marks are reserved for papers that are well written, demonstrate a thorough and comprehensive understanding of the material, and advance a well substantiated and creative thesis that links the disparate readings. The first paper is due on February 24. The second paper is due on March 30. Late submissions are penalized a flat 15%, whether they are 7 minutes or 7 days late, after which I accept no further submissions. Submissions are via turnitin.com. Details will follow.

*Term Paper (35%):* Choose a topic that is in the news concerning Central Asia. Write a concise report (2200-2800 words; provide a word-count) that, based on **scholarly** research on related/similar topics, gives scholarly depth to the news coverage of your topic. Top marks are reserved for papers that are well written, well researched, and offer a thesis that is clear, convincing, and innovative. Papers under 2000 words or over 3000 words are penalized a full letter grade. Due on April 6. Late submissions are penalized a flat 15%, whether 7 minutes or 7 days late, after which I accept no further submissions. Submissions are via turnitin.com. Details will follow.

## Course Policies

*Office hours:* No appointment is needed. If you cannot make office hours but would like to meet, email me to schedule a mutually agreeable time.

*Email:* Consult the syllabus and other course information before sending email. If you have a simple question, send a message. If you do not receive a reply within 3 days, please resend. Email is great, but extended conversations are conducted face to face.

*Keep copies:* Keep draft work and hard copies of all assignments until the marked versions are returned.

*Late penalties:* Reactions to the film may be submitted up to two weeks after the due date without penalty; I will not accept submissions after that. All other papers, if late, are penalized a flat 15% of possible marks; no paper is accepted more than 7 days late.

*Plagiarism:* Plagiarism is a serious academic offence and will be dealt with accordingly. For further clarification and information, please see the University of Toronto's policy on Plagiarism at <http://www.utoronto.ca/writing/plagsep.html>. This course uses Turnitin.com, a web-based program to deter plagiarism. Students agree that by taking this course all required papers may be subject to submission for textual similarity review to Turnitin.com for the detection of plagiarism. All submitted papers will be included as source documents in the Turnitin.com reference database solely for the purpose of detecting plagiarism of such papers. The terms that apply to the University's use of Turnitin.com are described on the Turnitin.com web site.

*Extensions:* Sometimes extraordinary circumstances justify an extension. I discuss possible extensions during office hours, not via email. I consider such circumstances only until 2 weeks before the due date. After that, I discuss extensions only if a student has an official note from a doctor or from the University.

*Missed Assignments:* If, due to a bona-fide emergency, you miss an assignment you must: 1) contact me within 48 hours with a complete explanation, and 2) provide official documentation. I consider the your request on an individual basis; in some cases, I authorize make-up assignments, in other cases I do not.

*Medical or Other Documentation:* If an illness or other event interferes with your ability to complete your work on schedule, you need to provide official documentation. If you are truly incapacitated, your documentation must show this. I scrutinize the documentation to see how *long* of an extension, if any, is warranted, based on the severity and duration of your incapacitation.

*Accessibility Needs:* The University of Toronto is committed to accessibility. If you require accommodations or have any accessibility concerns, visit <http://studentlife.utoronto.ca/accessibility> as soon as possible.

*Notice of Collection:* The U. of Toronto respects your privacy. The information on medical certificates is collected pursuant to section 2(14) of the University of Toronto Act, 1971. It is collected for the purpose of administering accommodations for academic purposes based on medical grounds. The department will maintain a record of all medical certificates received. At all times it will be protected in accordance with the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act. If you have questions, please refer to [www.utoronto.ca/privacy](http://www.utoronto.ca/privacy) or contact the University's Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Office at 416-946-5835. Room 201, McMurrich Bldg., 12 Queen's Park Crescent, Toronto, ON, M5S 1A1.

## **Equity Statement**

The University of Toronto is committed to equity and respect for diversity. All members of the learning environment in this course should strive to create an atmosphere of mutual respect. As a course instructor, I will neither condone nor tolerate behaviour that undermines the dignity or self-esteem of any individual in this course and wish to be alerted to any attempt to create an intimidating or hostile environment. It is our collective responsibility to create a space that is inclusive and welcomes discussion. Discrimination, harassment and hate speech will not be tolerated. If you have any questions, comments, or concerns you may contact the U of T Equity and Diversity officer.

## **Course Outline**

### **Week 1 (January 13): Introduction and In-Class film ("The Orator")**

### **Week 2 (January 20): The Onset of Soviet Power**

- Finish viewing "The Orator": <https://goo.gl/kodxmj>
- Niccolò Pianciola and Paolo Sartori, "Waqf in Turkestan: The Colonial Legacy and the Fate of an Islamic Institution in Early Soviet Central Asia, 1917–1924," *Central Asian Survey* 26(4), 2007
- Jeff Sahadeo, "Epidemic and Empire: Ethnicity, Class, and 'Civilization' in the 1892 Tashkent Cholera Riot," *Slavic Review* 64(1), Spring 2005: 117-39
- Yuri Slezkine, "The USSR as a Communal Apartment, or How a Socialist State Promoted Ethnic Particularism," *Slavic Review* 53(2), 1994: 414-452

### **Additional**

- Keith Darden & Anna Grzymala-Busse, "The Great Divide: Literacy, Nationalism, and the Communist Collapse," *World Politics*, 59(1), 2006: 83-115

- Francine Hirsch, "Towards an Empire of Nations: Border-Making and the Formation of 'Soviet' National Identities," *Russian Review*, 59(2), 2000: 201-26

### **Week 3 (January 27): Soviet Period**

- *Review of "The Orator" due by 11:59 pm via Turnitin.com*
- Adrienne Edgar, "Bolshevism, Patriarchy, and the Nation: The Soviet 'Emancipation' of Muslim Women in Pan-Islamic Perspective," *Slavic Review* 65(2), 2006
- Steven Sabol, "The Creation of Soviet Central Asia: the 1924 National Delimitation," *Central Asian Survey* 4(2), 1995: 225-41
- Adeeb Khalid, "Ulama and the State in Uzbekistan," *Asian J. of Social Science*, 42(5), 2014: 517-35
- Eren Tasar, "Islamically Informed Soviet Patriotism in Postwar Kyrgyzstan," *Cahiers du monde russe* 52(2), 2012: 387-404

#### Additional

- *Ethnographies of the State*, Ch. 12 by Cynthia Werner and Kathleen Purvis-Roberts
- Stephane A. Dudoignon, "From revival to mutation: the religious personnel of Islam in Tajikistan, from de-Stalinization to independence (1955-91)," *Central Asian Survey* 30(1), 2011: 53-80

### **Week 4 (February 3): Islam**

- Eric McGlinchey, "Divided Faith: Trapped between State and Islam in Uzbekistan," in Jeff Sahadeo and Russell Zanca, eds., *Everyday Life in Central Asia*, Indiana UP, 2007
- Thomas Barfield, "An Islamic State Is a State Run by Good Muslims: Religion as a Way of Life and Not an Ideology in Afghanistan," in Robert W. Hefner, ed., *Remaking Muslim Politics: Pluralism, Contestation, Democratization*, Princeton University Press, 2004, pp. 213-39
- Stuart Horsman, "Themes in Official Discourses on Terrorism in Central Asia," *Third World Quarterly* 26(1), 2005: 199-213
- Olcott, Martha Brill. "Religion and State Policy In Central Asia." *The Review of Faith & International Affairs* 12(4): 2014: 1-15

#### Additional

- Berna Turam, "A Bargain Between the Secular State and Turkish Islam: Politics of Ethnicity in Central Asia," *Nations and Nationalism* 10(3), 2004: 353-374
- Thibault, Hélène. "The Secular and the Religious in Tajikistan: Contested Political Spaces." *Studies in Religion/Sciences Religieuses* 42(2), 2013: 173-189

### **Week 5 (February 10): Afghanistan I**

- Jennifer Murtazashvili, excerpts from forthcoming book, to be provided
- Thomas Barfield, "Problems in establishing legitimacy in Afghanistan," *Iranian Studies* 37(2), 2004: 263-93
- Thomas Barfield, "Culture and Custom in Nation-Building: Law in Afghanistan," *Maine Law Review* 60(2), 2008: 348-73

#### Additional

- Wilde, Andreas, and Katja Mielke. "Order, stability, and change in Afghanistan: from top-down to bottom-up state-making," *Central Asian Survey* 32(3), 2013: 353-70
- Kristian Berg Harpviken, "Transcending Traditionalism: The Emergence of Non-State Military Formations in Afghanistan," *Journal of Peace Research* 34, August 1997: 271-87

### **Week 6 (February 17): READING WEEK**

## **Week 7 (February 24): Comparative Perspectives on State, Society, and Regime**

- *Pause-and-Think Paper due by 11:59 pm*
- Introduction, *Ethnographies of the State*
- Anna Grzymala-Busse and Pauline Jones Luong. "Reconceptualizing the state: lessons from post-communism." *Politics & Society* 30(4), 2002: 529-554
- McGlinchey, Introduction
- Edward Schatz, "The Soft Authoritarian 'Tool Kit': Agenda-Setting Power in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan," *Comparative Politics*, 2009: 203-22

### Additional

- Erica Marat, "Nation Branding in Central Asia: a New Campaign to Present Ideas about the State and the Nation," *Europe-Asia Studies* 61(7), 2009: 1123-1136
- Kelly M. McMann, "Market Reform as a Stimulus to Particularistic Politics," *Comparative Political Studies* 42(7): 2009: 971-994
- Scott Radnitz, "The Color of Money: Privatization, Economic Dispersion, and the Post-Soviet Revolutions," *Comparative Politics* 42(2), 2010: 127-146

## **Week 8 (March 2): Kazakhstan**

- *Ethnographies of the State*, Ch. 2 (Dubuisson), Ch. 5 (Bissenova), Ch. 6 (Laszczkowski)
- McGlinchey, chapter on Kazakhstan

### Additional

- Edward Schatz, "Transnational Image Making and Soft Authoritarian Kazakhstan," *Slavic Review*, 2008: 50-62
- Elena Maltseva, "Cracks in the System: What Does the Zhanaozen Incident Tell Us about Regime Stability in Kazakhstan?" To be provided.

## **Week 9 (March 9): Kyrgyzstan**

- McGlinchey, chapter on Kyrgyzstan
- *Ethnographies of the State*, Ch. 3 (Ismailbekova), Ch. 4 (Beyer), Ch. 11 (Liu), Ch. 8 (Reeves)

### Additional

- Scott Radnitz, "What really happened in Kyrgyzstan?" *Journal of Democracy* 17(2): 2006: 132-146
- Michele E. Commercio, "The Politics and Economics of 'Retraditionalization' in Kyrgyzstan and Tajikistan." *Post-Soviet Affairs* (2014): 1-28

## **Week 10 (March 16): Tajikistan**

- Jesse Driscoll, *Warlords and Coalition Politics in Post-Soviet States*. New York: Cambridge UP, 2015 [available electronically]

### Additional

- John Heathershaw, "Peacebuilding as Practice: Discourses from Post-Conflict Tajikistan." *International Peacekeeping* 14.2 (2007): 219-36
- Menga, Filippo. "Building a nation through a dam: the case of Rogun in Tajikistan." *Nationalities Papers* 43.3 (2015): 479-494.

### **Week 11 (March 23): Uzbekistan (and Turkmenistan)**

- *Ethnographies of the State*, Ch. 10 (Trevisani), Ch. 9 (Kendzior)
- McGlinchey, chapter on Uzbekistan
- Charles J. Sullivan. 2015. "Civil Society in Chains: The Dynamics of Sociopolitical Relations in Turkmenistan," in Charles E. Ziegler, ed., *Civil Society and Politics in Central Asia*. Lexington: University Press of Kentucky, pp. 249-275

#### Additional

- Murtazashvili, Jennifer. "Coloured by revolution: the political economy of autocratic stability in Uzbekistan." *Democratization* 19(1), 2012: 78-97.
- Johan Rasanayagam, "The Politics of Culture and the Space for Islam: Soviet and Post-Soviet Imaginaries in Uzbekistan," *Central Asian Survey* 33(1): 2014: 1-14
- Neema Noori, "Expanding State Authority, Cutting Back Local Services: Decentralization and its Contradictions in Uzbekistan," *Central Asian Survey* 25(4), 2006: 533-49

### **Week 12 (March 30): Afghanistan II**

- *Pause-and-Think Paper due by 11:59 pm*
- Coburn, entire book
- Selected chapters from Jennifer Murtazashvili's forthcoming book, to be provided

#### Additional

- Antonio Giustozzi, Afghanistan Regional Forum No. 10, September 2013, George Washington University, Central Asia Program, "The Next Congo: Regional Competition for Influence in Afghanistan in the Wake of NATO Withdrawal," [http://www.centralasiaprogram.org/images/Afghan\\_Forum\\_10\\_September\\_2013.pdf](http://www.centralasiaprogram.org/images/Afghan_Forum_10_September_2013.pdf)
- One reading, TBA

### **Week 13 (April 6): More Comparisons**

- *Term Paper Due by 11:59 pm tonight*
- Kandiyoti, Deniz. "Post-colonialism compared: Potentials and limitations in the Middle East and Central Asia." *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 34(2): 2002: 279-297