

University of Toronto
Department of Political Science

POL 381 H1 (F)

Topics in Political Theory:

Zionism: Between Secular Ideology and Religious Redemption

Thursday 12:00 – 2:00
Room: UC 163

Instructor: Merom Kalie
Office hours: Thursday 2:30 - 4:30 pm, room SS3118
Email: merom.kalie@mail.utoronto.ca

Course description:

The course will examine different perspectives on the relationships between Zionism - the Jewish national movement - and the Jewish religion. It will discuss a range of views, from those who perceive Zionism to be a secular movement that defied tradition and religion, to those who perceive Zionism in religious and Messianic terms.

During the first half of the course, we will discuss the evolution of the subject from the origins of the Zionist movement to the establishment of the state of Israel and the Six Days War. In the second half of the course, we will discuss current views about the subject and its implications for contemporary Israeli society and the Israeli-Arab conflict.

Course requirements:

1. One short paper, due on October 17th, 2013 (maximum 1250 words, 20% of the final mark).
2. One research paper, due on November 14th, 2013 (maximum 2500 words, 40% of the final mark). A list of suggested topics together with detailed instructions will be posted. You are welcome to write your research paper about a topic that is not on the list, with the instructor's approval in advance.
3. A final exam, at a date to be determined by the Faculty of Arts and Science (40% of the final mark).

Excluding documented medical reasons or very serious emergencies, the penalties for late submissions will be 2 points for each calendar day.

Students are strongly advised to keep rough and draft work and hard copies of their essays and assignments before handing it to the department. These should be kept until the marked assignments have been returned.

Academic integrity

Plagiarism is a serious academic offence and will be dealt with accordingly. For further clarification and information, please see the University of Toronto's policy on academic integrity at www.artsci.utoronto.ca/osai/students.

From U of T's Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters: "It shall be an offence for a student knowingly: (d) to represent as one's own any idea or expression of an idea or work of another in any academic examination or term test or in connection with any other form of academic work, i.e. to commit plagiarism....(e) to submit, without the knowledge and approval of the instructor to whom it is submitted, any academic work for which credit has previously been obtained or is being sought in another course or program of study in the University or elsewhere."

Turnitin.com

Normally, students will be required to submit their course essays to Turnitin.com for a review of textual similarity and detection of possible plagiarism. In doing so, students will allow their essays to be included as source documents in the Turnitin.com reference database, where they will be used solely for the purpose of detecting plagiarism. The terms that apply to the University's use of the Turnitin.com service are described on the Turnitin.com web site.

If, as a student, you object to using Turnitin.com, an alternative arrangement for the submission of your written assignment will be available. You will be required to: (1) contact the instructor prior to the assignment due date, (2) submit all your rough work and notes with your assignment.

Accessibility Needs:

The University of Toronto is committed to accessibility. If you require accommodations for a disability, or have any accessibility concerns about the course, the classroom or course materials, please contact Accessibility Services as soon as possible: accessibility.services@utoronto.ca or <http://www.accessibility.utoronto.ca>

Communication:

Course announcements and information will be posted on Blackboard:
<https://portal.utoronto.ca/webapps/portal/frameset.jsp>. You are advised to visit this site frequently.

Readings:

Scanned copies or links to all the required readings are available on the course website on Blackboard (under “Required Readings”).

The books from which the required readings were taken are available at the short-term loan section at Robarts library.

You are encouraged to visit the websites of following Israeli newspapers:

Haaretz (English edition) www.haaretz.com
Ynet (English edition) www.ynetnews.com
Arutz Sheva (English edition) www.israelnationalnews.com

Relevant academic journals:

- *Israel Studies*
- *Israel Studies Review* (formerly- *Israel Studies Forum*)
- *Israel Affairs*
- *Journal of Israeli History*

Course Topics and Readings

Lecture 1: Introduction.

Lecture 2: The background to Zionism: the pre-modern Jewish society, the Enlightenment and European nationalism

Jacob Katz, *Tradition and Crisis* (New York: New York University Press, 1993), chapters 2-4 (pp. 11-30), and chapter 18 (pp. 156-169).

Hans Kohn "Western and Eastern Nationalism", in Joan Hutchinson and Anthony Smith, *Nationalism*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994), pp. 162-165.

Recommended:

Gideon Shimoni, *The Zionist Ideology* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press, 1995), pp. 2-51.

Mordecai M. Kaplan, *Judaism as a Civilization* (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society, 2010 [1934]), pp. 3-27.

Hedva Ben-Israel Kidron, "Zionism and European Nationalisms: Comparative Aspects" *Israel Studies* 8/1 (Spring 2003), 91-104.

Charles Taylor, *Modern Social Imaginaries* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2004).

A recommended article which is relevant to the entire course:

Edward Said, "Zionism from the standpoint of its victims", *Social Text*, No. 1, (Winter 1979), pp. 7-58

Lecture 3: The birth of Zionism

Walter Laqueur, *A History of Zionism* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1972), pp. 40-83

Leon Pinsker, excerpts from "*Auto Emancipation*" (available on Blackboard, under "electronic readings").

Theodor Herzl, "The Jewish State", in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp. 218-223

Recommended:

Walter Laqueur, *A History of Zionism* (London: Widened & Nicolson, 1972), pp. 3-39

Leo Pinsker, "Auto Emancipation", in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp.182-198

Theodor Herzl: *The Jewish State: An Attempt at a Modern Solution of the Jewish Question* (London: Pordes, 1972).

Theodor Herzl, *Old New Land* (New York: Juakus Wiener Publishing and The Herzl Press, 1987).

Ehud Luz, *Parallels Meet: Religion and Nationalism in the early Zionist Movement (1882-1904)* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1988).

Yosef Salmion, "Tradition and Nationalism", Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapria (eds.), *Essential Papers on Zionism* (New York: New York University Press), pp. 94-116

Michael Walzer, "Zionism and Judaism: The Paradox of National Liberation", *Journal of Israeli History*, 26/2 (September 2007), 125-136.

Shlomo Avineri, *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State* (New York: Basic Books, 1981), pp. 47-55, 88-100

Amnon Rubinstein, *From Herzl to Rabin: the Changing Image of Zionism* (New York: Holmes and Meier, 2000), pp. 9-24.

Lecture 4: Secular revolutionary Zionism

Aharon David Gordon, "Logic for the Future" and "Some Observations", in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp. 371-372, 375-379

Amia Lieblich, *Kibbutz Makom: Report from an Israeli Kibbutz* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1981), pp. 24-27

Anita Shapira, "The Religious Motifs of the Labor Movement", In: Shmuel Almog, Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapira (ed.), *Zionism and Religion* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1998), pp. 251-272.

Arye Naor, "Jabotinsky's New Jew: Concept and Models", *The Journal of Israeli History*, 30/2 (September 2011), 141-159.
http://resolver.scholarsportal.info/myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/resolve/13531042/v30i0002/141_jnjcam

Recommended:

Zeev Sternhell, *The Founding Myths of Israel* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998).

Eyal Chowers, *The Political Philosophy of Zionism: Trading Jewish Words for a Hebraic Land* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012).

Boaz Neumann, *Land and Desire in Early Zionism* (Waltham, Mass.: Brandeis University Press, 2011).

Muki Tzur, "Pesach in the Land of Israel: Kibbutz Haggadot", *Israel Studies* 12.2 (July 2007) 74-103.

Gideon Shimoni, *The Zionist Ideology* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press, 1995).
 Chapter one: Social Origins of Jewish Nationalism), pp.269-332

Israel Kolatt, Anita Shapira, "Zionism and Political Messianism", in *Totalitarian Democracy and After, International Colloquium in Memory of Jacob L. Talmon, Jerusalem, 21-24 June, 1982* (Jerusalem: Israel Academy of Sciences and Humanities: Magnes Press, Hebrew University, 1984), pp. 342-361.

Oz Almog, *The Sabra: The Creation of the New Jew* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000).

Shlomo Avineri, *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State* (New York: Basic Books, 1981), pp. 139-150.

Eliezer Don-Yehiya and Charles S. Liebman, "Zionist Ultrnationalism and its Attitude toward Religion", *Journal of Church and State*, 23/2 (1981), pp. 259-273
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129278>

Yael Zerubavel, *Recovered Roots: Collective Memory and the Making of Israeli National Tradition* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1995).

**Lecture 5: Ahad Ha'am. The Canaanite movement.
The Ultra Orthodox response to Zionism.**

Ahad Ha'am, "On Nationalism and Religion", in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp. 261-262.

Shlomo Avineri, *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State* (New York: Basic Books, 1981), pp. 112-124.

Aviezer Ravitzky, "Munkacs and Jerusalem". In: Shmuel Almog, Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapira (ed.), *Zionism and Religion* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1998), pp. 67-89.

Recommended:

Alfred Gottschalk, "From Tradition to Modernity: Ahad Ha-Am's Quest for a Spiritual Zionism". In : Ronald A. Brauner (ed.), *Shivim; Essays and Studies in Honor of Ira Eisenstein* (Philadelphia: Reconstructionist Rabbinical College, 1977), 135-154.

Shalom Ratzabi. *Between Zionism and Judaism: the Radical Circle in Brith Shalom, 1925-1933* (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2002), pp. 188-234.

Steven Jefferey Zipperstei, "Symbolic politics, religion and the emergence of Ahad Haam", In: Shmuel Almog, Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapira (ed.), *Zionism and Religion* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1998), pp.55-66.

Boaz Evron, *Jewish State of Israeli Nation?*, chapter 11: Canaanism: solutions and problems (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1995), pp. 205-222.

Ron Kuzar, "Two Brief Introductions to Hebrew Canaanism",
http://members.tripod.com/alabasters_archive/kuzar_intros.html

Lecture 6: Early religious Zionism – The Mizrahi movement, Rabbi Kook, and Martin Buber

Martin Buber, “Hebrew Humanism” and “An Open Letter to Mahatma Gandhi”, in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp. 457-465.

Gideon Shimoni, *The Zionist Ideology* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press, 1995). Chapter one: Social Origins of Jewish Nationalism, pp. 136-165

Recommended:

Aviezer Ravitzky, *Messianism, Zionism, and Jewish Religious Radicalism*, (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1996), pp. 79-144.

Dov Schwartz. *Religious-Zionism: History and Ideology* (Boston: Academic Studies Press, 2009).

Dan Avnon, *Martin Buber - the Hidden Dialogue* (Lanham, Md.: Rowman & Littlefield, 1998), pp. 179-213.

Bernard Sausser, *Existence and Utopia - The Social and Political Thought of Martin Buber* (Associated University Press, 1981), pp. 137-172.

Asher Cohen and Charles S. Liebman, *Religion, Democracy and Israeli Society* (Amsterdam: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1997), pp. 37-55.

Shalom Ratzhabi, “Religious Thinkers on the Secular State”, *Israel Studies*, 13/3 (fall 2008), 114-136.

Meir Seidler, “Zionism’s Conflicting Founding Designs and their Ideological Impact”, *Israel Studies*, 17/3 (fall 2012), 176-190.

Lecture 7: Modern secular Israel

Amos Oz, "Between Right and Right", in: *How to Cure a Fanatic* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006), pp. 3-35.

Yaron Ezrahi, *Rubber Bullets: Power and Conscience in Modern Israel* (Berkeley and London: University of California Press, 1997), pp. 98-116.

Jonathan Rynhold and Dov Waxman, "Ideological Change and Israel's Disengagement from Gaza", *Political Science Quarterly* 123/1 (2008), 11-37
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129279>

Recommended:

Dov Waxman, "From Controversy to Consensus: Cultural Conflict and the Israeli Debate Over Territorial Withdrawal", *Israel Studies* 13/2 (Summer 2008), 73-96
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/224220>

Amos Oz, "The meaning of homeland", in Carol Diament (ed.), *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), pp.248-254.

David Grossman, speech at the Rabin memorial, November 4th, 2006
<http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2006/nov/07/israel>

Dov Waxman, "From Controversy to Consensus: Cultural Conflict and the Israeli Debate Over Territorial Withdrawal", *Israel Studies* 13/2 (Summer 2008), 73-96
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/224220>

"Amazing Grace" an interview with Zeev Sternhell
<http://2ndphilolog.wordpress.com/debattenstreitthemen/amazing-grace-by-ari-shavit/>

Tamar Hermann, *The Israeli Peace Movement- a Shattered Dream* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009).

Yoav Peled and Gershon Shafir, *Being Israeli: the Dynamics of Multiple Citizenship* (NY: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

Asher Arian, "The challenge of democratic and Jewish state", in: Barry Kosmin and Ariela Keysar (eds.), *Secularism, Women and the State: the Mediterranean World in the 21st Century* (Hartford, CN: Institute for the study of secularism in society and culture, 2009), pp. 77-89

Gideon Katz, "Secularism and the Imaginary Polemic of Israeli Intellectuals"
Israel Studies 13/3 (fall 2008), 43-63

Maoz Azaryahu, "McIsrael? On the Americanization of Israel", *Israel Studies* 5/1 (Spring 2000), 41-64.

Elan Ezrachi, "The quest for spirituality among secular Israelis", in Uzi Rebhun and Chaim I. Waxman (ed.), *Jews in Israel: Contemporary Social and Cultural Patterns* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press: Published by University Press of New England, 2004), pp. 315-330.

Uri Ram, *The Globalization of Israel: McWorld in Tel Aviv, Jihad in Jerusalem* (New York : Routledge, 2008).

Uri Ram, "Post-Zionist Studies in Israel-The First Decade," *Israel Studies Forum* 20/2 (Winter 2005), pp. 22-45.

Laurence J. Silberstein, *The Postzionism Debates: Knowledge and Power in Israeli Culture* (New York and London: Routledge, 1999).

Lecture 8: Contemporary Religious Zionism

Hanan Porat, "We are the Compost of the Next Generation", in Carol Diamant (ed.), *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), pp.188-195.

Shlomo Riskin, "Religions Zionism Revisited", in Carol Diamant (ed.), *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), pp. 208-214.

Moshe Hellinger, "Political Theology in the Thought of 'Merkaz HaRav' Yeshiva and its Profound Influence on Israeli Politics and Society since 1967", *Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions*, 9/4 (December 2008), 533-550.

<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129280>

Etta Bick, "Rabbis and Rulings: Insubordination in the Military and Israeli Democracy", *Journal of Church and State*, 49/2 (Spring 2007), 305-328

<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129281>

Recommended:

Gadi Taub, *The Settlers and the Struggle over the Meaning of Zionism*, New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010

Gadi Taub, "God's Politics in Israeli's Supreme Court- the retreat of theology in religious settlers' politics", *Journal of Modern Jewish Studies Thought*, 6/3 (November 2007), pp. 289 - 299

Motti Inbari, *Messianic Religious Zionism Confronts Israeli Territorial Compromises*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012.

Geideon Aran, "From religious Zionism to Zionist religion- the root of Gush Emunim", *Studies in Contemporary Jewry*, 2, (1986) 116-143.

Idith Zertal, Akiva Eldar, *Lords of the Land: the War Over Israel's Settlements in the Occupied Territories, 1967-2007* (New York : Nation Books, 2007).

Yeshayahu Leibowitz, "The Religious Significance of the State of Israel", in Carol Diamant (ed.), *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), pp. 179-187.

Aviezer Ravitzky, "Let us search our path". In: Yoram Peri (ed.), *The Assassination of Yitzhak Rabin*, (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2000) pp. 141-162.

Stuart Cohen, "Tensions Between Military Service and Jewish Orthodoxy In Israel", *Israel Studies* 12.1 (2007) 103-126.

Michael Feige, *Settling in the Hearts: Jewish Fundamentalism in the Occupied Territories* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2009).

Michael Feige, "Soft Power: The Meaning of Home for Gush Emunim Settlers", *The Journal of Israeli History*, 32/1 (2013), 109-126.

Shlomo Fischer, "Religious Zionism between Nationalism, Religion and Modernity", *Forum Bosnae*, issue 38/2006, 55-63.

Lecture 9: Contemporary Religious Zionism - The Margins

Aviezer Ravitsky, *Roots of Kahanism - Consciousness and Political Reality*, (Jerusalem: The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Shazar Library, 1986), pp. 9-38.
Can also be found at *The Jerusalem Quarterly*, 39 (1986), 90-108.

Ehud Sprinzak. "Israel's Radical Right and the Countdown to the Rabin Assassination". In: Yoram Peri (ed.), *The Assassination of Yitzhak Rabin*, (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2000) pp. 96-128.

Ariel Zellman, "Eretz Shalom: Interview with Nahum Pachnik"
<http://arielzellman.wordpress.com/2010/10/13/eretz-shalom-interview-with-nahum-pachenik/>

Website of "Rabbis for Human Rights" organization: <http://rhr.org.il/eng/>

Recommended:

Ami Pedahzur and Arie Perliger, *Jewish Terrorism in Israel* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2009)

Motti Inbari, *Jewish Fundamentalism and the Temple Mount: Who will Build the Third Temple?* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2009).

Hanne Eggen Røislien, “Living with Contradiction: Examining the Worldview of the Jewish Settlers in Hebron”, *International Journal of Conflict and Violence*, 1/ 2 (2007), 169-184. <http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/224285>

Lecture 10: Contemporary Views of Israeli Ultra-Orthodox Jews

Nurit Stadler, Edna Lomsky-Feder and Eyal Ben Ari, “Fundamentalism's encounter with citizenship- the Haredim in Israel”, *Citizenship Studies*, 12/3 (June 2008), 215-231. <http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129282>

Recommended:

Aharon Rose, “The Haredim- a defense”, *Azure*, 25 (2006),

Nurit Stadler and Eyal Ben Ari: “Other-Worldly Soldiers? Ultra-Orthodox Views of Military Service in Contemporary Israel”, *Israel Affairs*, 9/4 (June 2003) 17-48.

Jacob Lupo, *New Directions in Haredi Society: Vocational Training and Academic Studies* (Jerusalem: Floersheimer Institute for Policy Studies, 2005).

**Lecture 11: Sephardic Jews and the Shas Movement.
Christian Zionism.**

Aaron Willis, “Redefining Religious Zionism - Shas' Ethno-Politics”, *Israel Studies Bulletin*, 8/1, pp. 3-8.

Yaakov Ariel, “An Unexpected Alliance: Christian Zionism and its Historical Significance“, *Modern Judaism*, 26/1 (February 2006), 74-100
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129283>

Recommended:

Nissim Leon, "The Secular Origins of Mizrahi Traditionalism", *Israel Studies* 13/3 (Fall 2008) 22-42

Shlomo Deshen, "The Emergence of the Israeli Sephardi Ultra- Orthodox Movement", *Jewish Social Studies* 11/2 (2005) 77-101.

Shlomo Fischer, "Excursus: Concerning the Rulings of R. Ovadiah Yosef Pertaining to the Thanksgiving Prayer, the Settlement of the Land of Israel, and Middle East Peace", *Cardozo Law Review*, 28/1 (October 2006) 229-44.

David Lehmann and Batia Siebzehner, *Remaking Israeli Judaism: the Challenge of Shas*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006).

Michael Perko, "Contemporary American Christian Attitudes to Israel Based on the Scriptures", *Israel Studies* 8/2 (2003) 1-17.

Yaakov Ariel, *An Unusual Relationship: Evangelical Christians and Jews* (NY: New York University Press, 2013)

Lecture 12: Jerusalem- a city of contesting visions.**Conclusion: Israel as an ideological enterprise.**

Meron Benvenisti, *City of Stone- The Hidden History of Jerusalem* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1996), pp. 69-105
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129449>

Tamar Mayer, "Jerusalem in and out of focus- the city in Zionist ideology", in: Tamar Mayer and Suleiman Ali Mourad (ed.), *Jerusalem: Idea and Reality* (London, New York: Routledge, 2008) pp. 224- 244

Recommended:

Motti Inbari, "Religious Zionism and the Temple Mount Dilemma - Key Trends", *Israel Studies* 12/2 (2007) 29-47.

Colin Chapman, *Whose Holy City? Jerusalem and the Future of Peace in the Middle East* (Michigan: Baker Books, 2004).