

POL 480H/2038H
Pluralism, Justice and Equality:
Political Imaginaries of Global Justice and Global Democracy

Instructor: Melissa S. Williams
Sidney Smith Hall Rm. 3040
Tel. 416-978-8220
e-mail: melissa.williams@utoronto.ca

Class meetings: Larkin 214, Thursdays, 10-12 (Note that the room is booked until 1:00 PM in case we need additional time for class discussion. Please do not book other commitments into this time slot.)

Course description:

Over the last several decades, the Western academy's theoretical understandings of justice and democracy have been profoundly reshaped by the wave of critical engagement by feminists, critical race theorists, queer theorists, and postcolonial theorists who drew attention to the ways in which both actually existing political and social institutions and theoretical models of justice and democracy have reinforced patterns of deep structural inequality along the lines of race, class, gender, culture and sexuality. Taken together, this wave of criticism drew attention to the dangers of false claims to universality for normative theorizing, and to the social situatedness of the theoretical enterprise as something to which theorists must attend if they are to maintain a healthy critical perspective on their own activity.

Although the theoretical debates unleashed by critical theorists of difference are still playing out, most of those debates have remained within the larger background framework of the territorially bounded constitutional state as the principal site of the most important theoretical questions concerning both justice and democracy. Meanwhile, the dynamics of globalization have rendered irresistible the judgment that the possibilities of democracy and justice *within* territorially bounded constitutional states are deeply conditioned by institutions, organizations and social and economic processes that exceed the political agency of those states. Accordingly, a growing number of political theorists have, in recent years, shifted their attention from justice and democracy within states to the criteria for assessing duties of justice across borders and the possibility of supranational, transnational or global democracy.

This course is governed by two broad purposes. First, we will simply canvass some of the most influential writings on global justice and global democracy and some of the leading critical responses to these. In doing so, we will explore the fundamental questions in normative theory that these works raise and address: What generates duties of justice, as contrasted with duties of humanitarian concern? Is it possible to owe duties of justice to people with whom we do not share dense social, political and economic relationships? Does the link between democracy and political legitimacy obtain only within the boundaries of sovereign territorial states? Or is it possible to disentangle the constructs of sovereignty from those of democratic agency, authorization, and accountability?

Because of time constraints, we will not be able to survey all the relevant scholarly debates in great depth. Instead, our purpose will be to develop an understanding of some of the most central debates in the literature, which you can explore in greater depth in your written work in the course.

The second major goal of the course is to explore the *social (or political) imaginaries* that are operating in the theoretical accounts of global justice and global democracy that we are studying. The idea of a social imaginary is drawn from Charles Taylor, who uses the term to denote “the ways people imagine their social existence, how they fit together with others, how things go on between them and their fellows, the expectations that are normally met, and the deeper normative notions and images that underline these expectations.”¹ The purpose in drawing our attention to the social or political imaginaries that are operative in these influential theories of global justice and global democracy is to try to gain critical purchase on the fact that these theories – like the theories of justice and democracy that were criticized by the difference theorists – have been developed on the basis of Western intellectual traditions by scholars working within the Western academy. The intuition underlying this attention to political imaginaries is that as globalization proceeds, our theories of politics – and in particular our normative theories of *global* politics – ought to avoid the dangers of false universalism and false neutrality to which the critique from difference so powerfully drew our attention. Where should we look for intellectual resources through which to globalize our normative understandings of global politics and institutions? What would a globalized critical theory of difference look like, as applied to theories of global justice and global democracy?

Course readings:

A. Course Texts (marked [CT] in syllabus below)

The following texts are required reading for the course. They are available at the Toronto Women's Bookstore, 73 Harbord Street (south side, just west of Spadina Ave.), tel. 416-922-8744.²

John Rawls, *The Law of Peoples* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2001).

Thomas Pogge, *World Poverty and Human Rights* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2008).

Simon Caney, *Justice Beyond Borders: A Global Political Theory* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006).

James Bohman, *Democracy across Borders: From Dêmos to Dêmoi* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2007).

John Dryzek, *Deliberative Global Politics: Discourse and Democracy in a Divided World* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2007).

B. Online sources (marked [OL] in syllabus)

Where possible, I have assigned readings that are available through the UofT Libraries website (or through Google Scholar, accessed from a UofT account).

¹ *Modern Social Imaginaries* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004), p. 23.

² Please note that the Toronto Women's Bookstore offers prices that are generally competitive with Amazon and other online sources, though there may be some exceptions. Unlike online booksellers, however, the Toronto Women's Bookstore sponsors a great many readings and other events that enliven intellectual culture and support the exchange of ideas around questions of social justice in the city of Toronto. Textbook sales help make it possible for them to sustain these activities.

C. Course Packet (marked [CP] in syllabus)

Additional required readings are assembled in a Course Packet, available for purchase at The Copy Place, 120 Spadina Ave. (1/2 block south of Bloor, west side of Spadina), tel. 416-961-2679.

Course requirements:

- Participation. Each member of the seminar is expected to attend every class having carefully studied the readings and having read response essays on the Blackboard site. Participation in class discussion, presentation, and preparedness will count for 20 percent of your mark in the course.
- Response essays. Four times during the semester, each student will prepare a 2-page (500 word) critical response to the week's readings. These essays must be posted on the course Blackboard site no later than 6:00 PM the evening before class. Each essay will be worth 5 percent of your final mark, for a total of 20 percent.
- Term paper proposal. Due in class, March 8. Write a two-page proposal for your term paper, stating your thesis question and including a bibliography of the main sources you will be relying upon. Your bibliography should be comprised of at least two or three major works from the syllabus, but should also include sources from the wider literature to which you have been guided through your research. This proposal is worth 10 percent of your final mark.
- Term papers. Students are required to complete one term paper on a topic of their choice which is based closely on the assigned readings. Term papers are due no later than noon on the last day of class (April 5), and should be handed in at the beginning of class that day. Undergraduate term papers should be 15-20 pages in length; graduate papers should be 25-30 pages. Late penalties will accrue at the rate of 2 percent per day, including weekends. All papers should be submitted in hard copy, but please be prepared to submit a version electronically if requested.. The term paper is worth 50 percent of your final mark in the course.

* * * * *

I. Introduction: What is a Political Imaginary?

Week 1 (Jan. 12): Introduction

A. The concept of social and political imaginaries

Charles Taylor, "Modern Social Imaginaries," *Public Culture* 14(1): 91-24 (2002). [OL]

Note: If you prefer, read the book-length version of this argument in *Modern Social Imaginaries* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2004).

Suggested:

Melissa S. Williams, "Citizenship as Agency within Communities of Shared Fate," in Steven Bernstein and William Coleman (eds.), *Unsettled Legitimacy: Political Community, Power, and Authority in a Global Era*, (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2009), pp. 33-52. [circulated via email]

Week 2 (Jan. 19): Imagining the Global, Imagining Territory

A. Global political imaginaries

Manfred B. Steger, "Introduction: Political Ideologies and Social Imaginaries," in *The Rise of the Global Imaginary* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), pp. 1-15. [CP]

B. Territoriality and political imaginaries

Read *at least two* of the following:

John Borrows, "'Landed Citizenship': Narratives of Aboriginal Political Participation," in Will Kymlicka and Wayne Norman (eds.), *Citizenship in Diverse Societies* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp. 326-44. [CP]

Achille Mbembe, "At the Edge of the World: Boundaries, Territoriality and Sovereignty in Africa," *Public Culture* 12(1): 259-84 (2000). [OL]

Joseph Chan, "Territorial Boundaries and Confucianism," in Daniel Bell, *Confucian Political Ethics* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008), pp. 61-84. [CP]

M. Raquibuz Zaman, "Islamic Perspectives on Territorial Boundaries and Autonomy," in Sohail Hashmi (ed.), *Islamic Political Ethics: Civil Society, Pluralism and Conflict* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002), pp. 79-101. [CP]

II. Imagining Global Justice

Week 3 (Jan. 26): "Peoples" and Global Justice

John Rawls, *The Law of Peoples* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 2001). [CT]

Thomas Pogge, "Rawls on International Justice," *Philosophical Quarterly* 51 (2003): 246-53. [OL]

Allen Buchanan, "Rawls's Law of Peoples: Rules for a Vanished Westphalian World," *Ethics* 110(4): 697-721 (2000). [OL]

Suggested:

Joseph Heath, "Rawls on Global Distributive Justice: A Defence," *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 31 (Supp.): 193-226 (2005). [OL]

Chandran Kukathas, "The Mirage of Global Justice," *Social Philosophy & Policy* 23: 1-28 (2006). [OL]

Week 4 (Feb. 2): Cosmopolitan Justice & Its Critics

Thomas Pogge, *World Poverty and Human Rights* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2008), chapters 1, 4 and 5. [CT]

Michael Walzer, "Achieving Global and Local Justice," *Dissent* (Summer 2011): 42-48 [OL].

Week 5 (Feb. 9): Cosmopolitan Justice & Its Critics (cont'd)

Simon Caney, *Justice Beyond Borders: A Global Political Theory* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2006), chs. 1-5. [CT]

David Miller, "National Responsibility and Global Justice," *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 11(4): 383-99 (2008). [OL]

Philip Pettit, "A Republican Law of Peoples," *European Journal of Political Theory* 9(1): 70-94 (2010).

Week 6 (Feb. 16): Cosmopolitan Justice and Its Critics (cont'd)

Allen Buchanan, *Justice, Legitimacy and Self-Determination in International Law* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), Synopsis and Chapter 4, pp. 1-13, 191-230. [CP]

Nancy Fraser, "Reframing Justice in a Globalizing World," *New Left Review* 36: 69-88 (2005). [OL]

Iris Marion Young, "Responsibility and Global Justice: A Social Connection Model," *Social Philosophy & Policy* 23: 102-130 (2003). [OL]

Week 7 (Mar. 1): Provincializing Global Justice

Neera Chandoke, "How Much is Enough, Mr Thomas?" in Allison Jaggar (ed.), *Thomas Pogge and His Critics* (Polity, 2010), pp. 66-83[CP]

Charles W. Mills, "Realizing (Through Racializing) Pogge," in Allison Jaggar (ed.), *Thomas Pogge and His Critics* (Polity, 2010), pp. 151-74. [CP]

Peter Nosco, "Buddhism and the Globalization of Ethics," in William M. Sullivan and Will Kymlicka (eds.), *The Globalization of Ethics: Religious and Secular Perspectives* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp. 75-92. [CP]

Roxanne Euben, "Cosmopolitanisms Past and Present, Muslim and Western," in *Islam and Theory of Statecraft: Mirror for the Muslim Prince*, ed. Mehrzad Boroujerdi, Syracuse University Press, forthcoming. [distributed electronically with author's permission]

Suggested:

Andrew Robinson and Simon Tormey, "Resisting 'Global Justice: Disrupting the Colonial 'Emancipatory Logic' of the West," *Third World Quarterly* 30(8): 1395-1409 (2009). [OL]

III. Imagining Global Democracy

Week 8 (Mar. 8): Cosmopolitan Democracy

David Held, *Democracy and the Global Order: From the Modern State to Cosmopolitan Governance* (Cambridge: Polity, 1995), chapters 1, 7-12 (Part III). [CT]

Week 9 (Mar. 15): Cosmpolitan Democracy (cont'd)

Simon Caney, "Cosmopolitanism, Democracy and Distributive Justice," *Canadian Journal of Philosophy* 31 (Supp.): 29-63 (2005). [OL]

Daniele Archibugi, "Critical Debate on Cosmopolitan Democracy," in *The Global Commonwealth of Citizens: Toward Cosmopolitan Democracy* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2008), pp. 123-50. [CP]

Joshua Cohen and Charles Sabel, "Global Democracy?" *International Law and Politics* 37: 763-97 (2005). [OL]

Week 10 (Mar. 22): Trans-Demotic Democracy

James Bohman, *Democracy across Borders: From Dêmos to Dêmoi* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2007), chs. 1-3, Conclusion. [CT]

Week 11 (Mar. 29): Global Discursive Democracy

John Dryzek, *Deliberative Global Politics: Discourse and Democracy in a Divided World* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2007), chapters 1-3, 5-8. [CT]

Week 12 (Apr. 5): Global Democracy and Difference

Carol Gould, *Globalizing Democracy and Human Rights* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), chapters 1-5, 7, 9. [OL]

James Tully, "On Local *and* Global Citizenship: An Apprenticeship Manual," in *Political Philosophy in a New Key, Volume II: Imperialism and Civic Freedom* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), chapter 9. [CP]

Further suggested readings:

Christian List and Mathias Koenig-Archibugi, "Can There Be a Global Demos?" *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 38(1): 76-110. [OL]

Janet Conway and Jakeet Singh, "Radical Democracy in Global Perspective: Notes from the Pluriverse," *Third World Quarterly* 32 (4): 689-706 (2011). [OL]

James Tully, *Political Philosophy in a New Key, Volume II: Imperialism and Civic Freedom*, chapters 1 and 2.