

University of Toronto
Department of Political Science

POL 381 H1 (S)

Topics in Political Theory:

Zionism: Between Secular Ideology and Religious Redemption

Merom Kalie

Monday 6:00-8:00
Room SS 1085

Office hours: Monday, 2-4pm, room SS 3118
E-mail address: merom.kalie@utoronto.ca

Teacher Assistant: Jamie Levin
Email address: jamie.levin@utoronto.ca

Course description:

The course will examine different perspectives on the relationships between Zionism - the Jewish national movement - and the Jewish religion. It will discuss a range of views, from those who perceive Zionism to be a secular movement that defied tradition and religion, to those who perceive Zionism in religious and Messianic terms.

During the first half of the course, we will discuss the evolution of the subject from the origins of the Zionist movement to the establishment of the state of Israel and the Six Days War. In the second half of the course, we will discuss current views about the subject and its implications for contemporary Israeli society and the Israeli-Arab conflict.

Course requirements:

1. One short paper, in which you will be asked to analyze a primary source, should be submitted online by February 28, 2011 (maximum 1250 words, 20% of the final mark).
2. One research paper, due on March 21, 2011 (maximum 3000 words, 40% of the final mark). A list of suggested topics together with detailed instructions will be posted. You are welcome to write your research paper about a topic that is not on the list, with the Instructor's advance approval.
3. A final exam, at a date to be determined by the Faculty of Arts and Science (40% of the final mark).

Excluding documented medical reasons or very serious family emergencies, the penalties for late submissions will be 2 points for each day.

Students are strongly advised to keep rough and draft work and hard copies of their essays and assignments before handing it to the department. These should be kept until the marked assignments have been returned.

Plagiarism is a serious academic offence and will be dealt with accordingly. For further clarification and information, please see the University of Toronto's policy on plagiarism at <http://www.utoronto.ca/writing/plagsep.html>.

From U of T's Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters: "It shall be an offence for a student knowingly: (d) to represent as one's own any idea or expression of an idea or work of another in any academic examination or term test or in connection with any other form of academic work, i.e. to commit plagiarism....(e) to submit, without the knowledge and approval of the instructor to whom it is submitted, any academic work for which credit has previously been obtained or is being sought in another course or program of study in the University or elsewhere."

Normally, students will be required to submit their course essays to Turnitin.com for a review of textual similarity and detection of possible plagiarism. In doing so, students will allow their essays to be included as source documents in the Turnitin.com reference database, where they will be used solely for the purpose of detecting plagiarism. The terms that apply to the University's use of the Turnitin.com service are described on the Turnitin.com web site.

If, as a student, you object to using Turnitin.com, an alternative arrangement for the submission of your written assignment will be available. You will be required to: 1) contact the instructor prior to the assignment due date, 2) submit all your rough work and notes with your assignment.

Accessibility Needs:

The university of Toronto is committed to accessibility. If you require accommodations for a disability, or have any accessibility concerns about the course, the classroom or course materials, please contact Accessibility Services as soon as possible: disability.services@utoronto.ca or <http://studentlife.utoronto.ca/accessibility>.

Communication: course announcements and information will be posted in the "Blackboard," at U of T's Portal site:

<https://portal.utoronto.ca/webapps/portal/frameset.jsp>

You are advised to visit this site frequently.

Readings:

Copies of the all the required books are available in the short-term loan room at Robarts Library.

The links for the required readings that you can gain access to on-line are available on the syllabus and the course website.

The required readings that cannot be accessed online will also available in a course reader that can be purchased at *The Copy Place*, 720 Spadina Ave. (1/2 block south of Bloor, west side of Spadina, tel. 416-961-2679).

You are also encouraged to visit the websites of following Israeli newspapers:

Haaretz (English Edition) www.haaretz.com

The Jerusalem Post www.jpost.com

Arutz 7 (English Edition) www.israelnationalnews.com

Course Topics and Readings

Lecture 1: Introduction.

Lecture 2: The background to Zionism: the pre-modern Jewish society, the Enlightenment and European nationalism

Jacob Katz, *Tradition and Crisis* (New York : New York University Press, 1993), chapter 2-4 (pp. 11-30), and chapter 18 (pp. 156-169)

Hans Kohn "Western and Eastern Nationalism", in Joan Hutchinson and Anthony Smith, *Nationalism*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994), pp. 162-165

Recommended:

Gideon Shimoni, *The Zionist Ideology* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press, 1995), pp. 2-51.

Hedva Ben-Israel Kidron, "Zionism and European Nationalisms: Comparative Aspects"

Israel Studies 8/1 (Spring 2003), 91-104.

Charles Taylor, *Modern Social Imaginaries* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2004).

Recommended article (which is relevant to the entire course):

Edward Said, "Zionism from the standpoint of its victims", *Social Text*, No. 1, (Winter 1979), pp. 7-58

Lecture 3: The birth of Zionism

Shlomo Avineri, *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State* (New York: Basic Books, 1981), pp. 47-55.

Leo Pinsker, "Auto Emancipation", in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp.182-198

Theodor Herzl, "The Jewish State", in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp. 218-223

Walter Laqueur, *A History of Zionism* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1972), pp. 40-83

Recommended:

Walter Laqueur, *A History of Zionism* (London: Widened & Nicolson, 1972), pp. 3-39

Theodor Herzl: *The Jewish State : An Attempt at a Modern Solution of the Jewish Question* (London: Pordes, 1972).

Theodor Herzl, *Old New Land* (New York: Juakus Wiener Publishing and The Herzl Press,1987).

Ehud Luz, *Parallels Meet : Religion and Nationalism in the early Zionist Movement (1882-1904)* (Philadelphia : Jewish Publication Society, 1988).

Yosef Salmion, "tradition and nationalism", Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapria (eds.), *Essential Papers on Zionism* (New York: New York University Press), pp. 94-116

Michael Walzer, "Zionism and Judaism: The Paradox of National Liberation", *Journal of Israeli History*, 26/2 (September 2007) ,125-136.

Shlomo Avineri, *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State* (New York: Basic Books, 1981), pp. 88-100

Lecture 4: Secular revolutionary Zionism

Aharon David Gordon, "Logic for the Future" and "Some Observations", in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp. 371-372, 375-379

Amia Lieblich, *Kibbutz Makom: Report from an Israeli Kibbutz* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1981), pp.24-27

Anita Shapira, "The Religious Motifs of the Labor Movement", In: Shmuel Almog, Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapira (ed.), *Zionism and Religion* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1998), pp. 251-272.

Recommended:

Zeev Sternhell, *The Founding Myths of Israel* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998).

Eyal Chowers, "Time in Zionism", *Political Theory*, 26/ 5 (October 1998) 652-685.

Muki Tzur, "Pesach in the Land of Israel: Kibbutz Haggadot", *Israel Studies* 12.2 (July 2007) 74-103.

Gideon Shimoni, *The Zionist Ideology* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press, 1995). Chapter one: Social Origins of Jewish Nationalism), pp.269-332

Israel Kolatt, Anita Shapira, "Zionism and Political Messianism", in *Totalitarian Democracy and After; International Colloquium in Memory of Jacob L. Talmon, Jerusalem, 21-24 June, 1982* (Jerusalem: Israel Academy of Sciences and Humanities : Magnes Press, Hebrew University, 1984), pp. 342-361.

Oz Almog, *The Sabra : The Creation of the New Jew* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000).

Shlomo Avineri, *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State* (New York: Basic Books, 1981), pp. 139-150.

**Lecture 5: Ahad Ha'am. The Canaanite movement.
The Ultra Orthodox response to Zionism.**

Ahad Ha'am, "On Nationalism and Religion", in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp. 261-262.

Shlomo Avineri, *The Making of Modern Zionism: The Intellectual Origins of the Jewish State* (New York: Basic Books, 1981), pp. 112-124.

Eliezer Don- Yehiya and Charles S. Liebman, "Zionist Ultranationalism and its Attitude toward Religion", *Journal of Church and State*, 23/2 (1981), pp. 259-273
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129278>

Aviezer Ravitzky, "Munkacs and Jerusalem". In: Shmuel Almog, Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapira (ed.), *Zionism and Religion* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1998), pp. 67-89.

Recommended:

Alfred Gottschalk, "From tradition to modernity : Ahad Ha-Am's quest for a spiritual Zionism". In : Ronald A. Brauner (ed.), *Shivim; Essays and Studies in Honor of Ira Eisenstein* (Philadelphia: Reconstructionist Rabbinical College, 1977), 135-154.

Shalom Ratzabi. *Between Zionism and Judaism : the Radical Circle in Brith Shalom, 1925-1933* (Leiden; Boston : Brill,2002), pp. 188-234.

Steven Jefferey Zipperstei, "Symbolic politics, religion and the emergence of Ahad Haam", In: Shmuel Almog, Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapira (ed.), *Zionism and Religion* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1998), pp.55-66.

Boaz Evron, *Jewish State of Israeli Nation?*, chapter 11: Canaanism: solutions and problems (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1995), pp. 205-222.

Lecture 6: Early religious Zionism – The Mizrahi movement, Rabbi Kook, and Martin Buber

Martin Buber, “Hebrew Humanism” and “An Open Letter to Mahatma Gandhi”, in Arthur Hertzberg, *The Zionist Idea- a Historical Analysis and Reader* (New York: Atheneum, 1972), pp. 457-465.

Gideon Shimoni, *The Zionist Ideology* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press, 1995). Chapter one: Social Origins of Jewish Nationalism), pp. 136-165

Recommended:

Aviezer Ravitzky, *Messianism, Zionism, and Jewish Religious Radicalism*, (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1996), pp. 79-144.

Dov Schwartz. *Religious-Zionism: History and Ideology* (Boston : Academic Studies Press, 2009). pp. 10-18.

Dan Avnon, *Martin Buber - the Hidden Dialogue* (Lanham, Md. : Rowman & Littlefield, 1998), pp. 179-213.

Bernard Sausser, *Existence and Utopia- The Social and Political Thought of Martin Buber* (Associated University Press, 1981), pp. 137-172.

Asher Cohen and Charles S. Liebman, *Religion, Democracy and Israeli Society* (Amsterdam: Harwood Academic Publishers, 1997), pp. 37-55.

Shalom Ratzhabi, “Religious thinkers on the secular state”, *Israel Studies*, 13/3 (fall 2008), 114-136.

Dov Schwartz. *Religious-Zionism: History and Ideology* (Boston : Academic Studies Press, 2009).

Aviezer Ravitzky, *Messianism, Zionism, and Jewish Religious Radicalism*, (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1996), pp. 79-144.

Reading week

Lecture 7: Modern secular Israel

(First paper is due)

Amos Oz, "The meaning of homeland", in Carol Diament (ed.), *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), pp.248-254.

David Grossam, speech at the Rabin memorial, November 4th, 2006
<http://www.haaretz.com/hasen/spages/784034.html>

Yaron Ezrahi, *Rubber Bullets: Power and Conscience in Modern Israel* (Berkeley and London: University of California Press, 1997), pp. 98-116

Jonathan Rynhold and Dov Waxman, "Ideological Change and Israel's Disengagement from Gaza", *Political Science Quarterly* 123/1 (2008), 11-37
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129279>

Recommended:

Yoav Peled and Gershon Shafir, *Being Israeli: the Dynamics of Multiple Citizenship* (NY: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

Asher Arian, "The challenge of democratic and Jewish state", in: Barry Kosmin and Ariela Keysar (eds.), *Secularism, Women and the State: the Mediterranean World in the 21st Century*.(Hartford, CN: Institute for the study of secularism in society and culture, 2009), pp. 77-89

Gideon Katz, "Secularism and the Imaginary Polemic of Israeli Intellectuals"
Israel Studies 13/3 (fall 2008), 43-63

Yaron Peleg, *Israeli Culture Between the Two Intifadas : a Brief Romance* (Austin : University of Texas Press, 2008).

Maoz Azaryahu, "McIsrael? On the Americanization of Israel", *Israel Studies* 5/1 (Spring 2000), 41-64.

Elan Ezrachi, "The quest for spirituality among secular Israelis", in Uzi Rebhun and Chaim I. Waxman (ed.), *Jews in Israel: Contemporary Social and Cultural Patterns* (Hanover: Brandeis University Press: Published by University Press of New England, 2004), pp. 315-330.

Uri Ram, *The Globalization of Israel: McWorld in Tel Aviv, Jihad in Jerusalem* (New York : Routledge, 2008).

Uri Ram, "Post-Zionist Studies in Israel-The First Decade," *Israel Studies Forum* 20/2 (Winter 2005), 22-45.

Lecture 8: Contemporary Religious Zionism

Hanan Porat, "We are the Compost of the Next Generation", in Carol Diamant (ed.), *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), pp.188-195.

Shlomo Riskin, "Religions Zionism Revisited", in Carol Diamant (ed.), *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), pp. 208-214.

Moshe Hellinger, "Political Theology in the Thought of 'Merkaz HaRav' Yeshiva and its Profound Influence on Israeli Politics and Society since 1967", *Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions*, 9/4 (December 2008), 533-550.

<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129280>

Etta Bick, "Rabbis and Rulings: Insubordination in the Military and Israeli Democracy", *Journal of Church and State*, 49/2 (Spring 2007), 305-328

<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129281>

Recommended:

Gadi Taub, *The Settlers and the Struggle over the Meaning of Zionism*, New Haven : Yale University Press, 2010

Gadi Taub, "God's Politics in Israeli's Supreme Court- the retreat of theology in religious settlers' politics", *Journal of Modern Jewish Studies Thought*, 6/3 (November 2007), pp. 289 - 299

Motti Inbari. "When Prophecy Fails? The Theology of the Oslo Process- Rabbinical Responses to a Crisis of Faith", *Modern Judaism Advance Access* published on September 22, 2009. doi:10.1093/mj/kjp014

Geideon Aran, "From religious Zionism to Zionist religion- the root of Gush Emunim", *Studies in Contemporary Jewry*, 2, (1986) 116-143.

Idith Zertal, Akiva Eldar, *Lords of the land : the War over Israel's Settlements in the Occupied Territories, 1967-2007* (New York : Nation Books, 2007).

Yeshayahu Leibowitz, “The Religious Significance of the State of Israel”, in Carol Diamant (ed.), *Zionism: The Sequel* (New York: Hadassah, 1998), pp. 179-187.

Aviezer Ravitzky, “Let us search our path”. In: Yoram Peri (ed.), *The Assassination of Yitzhak Rabin*, (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2000) pp. 141-162

Stuart Cohen, “Tensions Between Military Service and Jewish Orthodoxy In Israel”, *Israel Studies* 12.1 (2007) 103-126.

Michael Feige, *Settling in the Hearts: Jewish Fundamentalism in the Occupied Territories*, Detroit : Wayne State University Press, 2009

Lecture 9: Contemporary Religious Zionism - The Margins

Aviezer Ravitsky, “Roots of Kahanism - Consciousness and political reality”, *The Jerusalem Quarterly*, 39 (1986), 90-108

Ehud Sprinzak. “Israel’s Radical Right and the Countdown to the Rabin Assassination”. In: Yoram Peri (ed.), *The Assassination of Yitzhak Rabin*, (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2000) pp. 96-128.

Website of “Rabbis for Human Rights” organization:
<http://www.rhr.org.il/index.php?language=en>

Websites of “Realistic Religious Zionism” movement: <http://www.tzionut.org/en/>

Recommended:

Motti Inbari, *Jewish Fundamentalism and the Temple Mount : Who will Build the Third Temple?* (Albany : State University of New York Press, 2009).

Hanne Eggen Røislien, “Living with Contradiction: Examining the Worldview of the Jewish Settlers in Hebron”, *International Journal of Conflict and Violence*, 1/ 2 (2007), 169-184

Lecture 10: Contemporary Views of Israeli Ultra Orthodox Jews

Nurit Stadler, Edna Lomsky-Feder and Eyal Ben Ari, “Fundamentalism's encounter with citizenship- the Haredim in Israel”, *Citizenship Studies*, 12/3 (June 2008), 215-231.
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129282>

Recommended:

Aharon Rose, "The Haredim- a defense", *Azure*, 25 (2006),

Nurit Stadler and Eyal Ben Ari: "Other-Worldly Soldiers? Ultra-Orthodox Views of Military Service in Contemporary Israel", *Israel Affairs*, 9/4 (June 2003) 17-48.

**Lecture 11: The Shas Movement.
Christian Zionism.**

Aaron Willis, "Redefining Religious Zionism - Shas' Ethno-Politics", *Israel Studies Bulletin*, 8/1, pp. 3-8.

Yaakov Ariel, "An Unexpected Alliance: Christian Zionism and its Historical Significance", *Modern Judaism*, 26/1 (February 2006), 74-100
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129283>

Recommended:

Shlomo Deshen, "The Emergence of the Israeli Sephardi Ultra- Orthodox Movement", *Jewish Social Studies* 11/2 (2005) 77-101.

Shlomo Fischer, "Excursus: Concerning the Rulings of R. Ovadiah Yosef Pertaining to the Thanksgiving Prayer, the Settlement of the Land of Israel, and Middle East Peace", *Cardozo Law Review*, 28/1 (October 2006) 229-44.

David Lehmann and Batia Siebzehner, *Remaking Israeli Judaism: the Challenge of Shas*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006).

Michael Perko, "Contemporary American Christian Attitudes to Israel Based on the Scriptures", *Israel Studies* 8/2 (2003) 1-17.

Timothy P. Weber, *On the Road to Armageddon: How Evangelicals Became Israel's Best Friend* (Grand Rapids, MI : Baker Academic, 2004).

Lecture 12: The question of Jerusalem.

Conclusion: Israel as an Ideological Enterprise.

Meron Benvenisti, *City of Stone- The Hidden History of Jerusalem* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1996), pp. 69-105
<http://simplelink.library.utoronto.ca/url.cfm/129449>

Tamar Mayer, “Jerusalem in and out of focus- the city in Zionist ideology”, in: Tamar Mayer and Suleiman Ali Mourad (ed.), *Jerusalem: Idea and Reality* (London, New York: Routledge, 2008) pp. 224- 244

Recommended:

Motti Inbari, “Religious Zionism and the Temple Mount Dilemma - Key Trends”, *Israel Studies* 12/2 (2007) 29-47.

Colin Chapman, *Whose Holy City? Jerusalem and the Future of Peace in the Middle East* (Michigan: Baker Books, 2004).