

University of Toronto  
Department of Political Science

POL 422S / 2324S

**Ethnonationalism and State-Building: The Communist and Post-Communist Experience**  
**2011 Spring Term**

Instructor : Professor Donald Schwartz  
Office : Room 3048, Sidney Smith Hall  
Telephone : 416-978-1048  
E-Mail : donald.schwartz@utoronto.ca  
Web Site : Blackboard  
Office Hours : Wednesday, Thursday 4:15 PM – 5:00 PM

We will explore ethnic politics and ethnonationalism in the Russian empire, the Soviet Union and the successor states. We will begin with an **historical overview** of the development of nationalities policy and ethnic relations in the prerevolutionary Russian Empire and the Bolshevik response and solutions to nationalities issues. We will then turn to an examination of nationalities policies through the major stages of development and under the different leaderships of the Soviet Union. This historical overview will be used to explore **different interpretations** of sources of ethnic conflict, patterns of ethnic conflict management, and their impact.

We will then turn to an examination of ethnic relations and nationalities policy under **Gorbachev**. This exploration will focus on the emergence of ethnic politics and its transformation into ethnonationalism. We will look at the impact of Gorbachev's strategy of radical reform on the nationalities and the role of ethnonationalism in the collapse of the Soviet Union.

Finally, we will undertake a series of case studies of nation-building in **the newly independent states**. The regional case studies will be used to explore the role of ethnicity and nationality in the process of **state-building** and as a source of **tension & conflict** in the successor states.

In brief, our exploration will offer us the opportunity to look at the role of ethnicity and nationality in two radically different contexts: the crisis of unity that led to the collapse of a multinational state; and, the ongoing impact of ethnicity and nationality in the process of state-building and constructing new interstate relations.

### Course Requirements

1. Each student will be responsible for **one seminar presentation**. In addition, each student's participation mark will be based on **weekly contributions** to seminar discussions.
2. Each student will be required to complete a **book review**. Guidelines for the book review are contained on a separate sheet. The book review is due in class on Wednesday, March 2, 2011.
3. Each student will be required to complete a **major paper**. The topic may be the same as a seminar presentation. The essay should be 15 pages, double-spaced, 12 point font, with 1" margins. Students should consult with the instructor at each stage in the choice of topic, bibliography, preparation, and writing of the essay. The paper is due in the last class in the Spring Term (April 6, 2011).
4. **Graduate students** will be required to complete a brief paper relating to research methodology, approaches, etc. The paper should be no longer than 5 pages. The paper may be incorporated into the major paper as a theoretical introduction or part of a critical analysis. The paper may involve: a critical analysis of research into nationalities in either the Soviet or post-Soviet period; a critical analysis of the sources and approach used for the major paper; a critical reassessment of your major paper. Students should consult the instructor individually to determine an appropriate topic and approach. The paper is due in the last class in the Spring Term (April 6, 2011).
5. Papers not submitted by the due date may be subject to a late penalty of 1% per day (including weekends).
6. The University of Toronto is encouraging faculty and students to conserve paper. As a result, to conserve paper, please print your reviews & essays *double-sided*.
7. Students are strongly advised to keep rough and draft work and hard copies of their essays before handing them in to the Department. These should be kept until the marked assignments have been returned.
8. Plagiarism is a serious academic offence and will be dealt with accordingly. For further clarification & information, see the University of Toronto's policy on plagiarism at <http://www.utoronto.ca/writing/plagsep.html>.

#### Summary of Fall Term Requirements

<u>Undergraduates</u>		<u>Graduates</u>	
Participation	20%	Participation	20%
Book Review	15%	Book Review	15%
Essay	65%	Essay	60%
		Methods Paper	5%

**Course Outline and Weekly Assignments**

Sources for Readings: (P) = Package; (R) = Robarts Library Short Term Loans; (EJ) = Electronic Journal

1. **Modernization and the Soviet Nationalities**

\*R.G. Suny & T. Martin, *A State of Nations*, Introduction, pages 3-7 (P)

\*R.G. Suny, "Rethinking Soviet Studies: Bringing the Non-Russians Back In", D. Orlovsky (ed), *Beyond Soviet Studies*, Chapter 4 (P)

\*R. Ganguly & R. Taras, "Ethnic Conflict on the World Stage", in Ganguly & Taras, *Understanding Ethnic Conflict*, Chapter 1 (P)

2. **Prerevolutionary Russia**

a. **The Russian Empire and Nationalities: Patterns of Rule and Differential Levels of Ethnonational Development**

\*S. Frederick Starr, "Tsarist Government: The Imperial Dimension", in J. Azrael, *Soviet Nationality Policies and Practices*, 3-38 (P)

b. **The Leninist Analysis and Response to the Russian Multinational Empire**

\*Walker Connor, *The National Question in Marxist-Leninist Theory and Strategy*, 5-42 (R)

\*R. Pipes, *Formation of the Soviet Union*, 29-49 (R)

\*Lenin and Stalin Documents (P)

3. **The Soviet Experience & Nation Destroying: Stalinist Modernization, Mobilization and Destruction**

\*G. Simon, *Nationalism and Policy Toward the Nationalities in the Soviet Union*, Chapters 4-9 (R) OR  
B. Nahaylo & V. Swoboda, *Soviet Disunion*, Chapters 6-14 (R)

\*R. Pipes, *The Formation of the Soviet Union*, 50-53, 107-113, 242-297 (R).

\*J.A. Armstrong, "The Ethnic Scene in the Soviet Union: The View of the Dictatorship", in Eric Goldhagen (ed.), *Ethnic Minorities in the Soviet Union*, 3-49 (P)

\*H. Carrere d'Encausse, *Decline of an Empire*, 27-36, 158-9 (R)

\*Connor, 254-63, 268-84, 300-322, 388-407 (R)

#### 4. **The Soviet Experience and Nation-Building: Federalism and Indigenization**

\*E.H. Carr, *The Bolshevik Revolution*, Volume I, 260-265 (P)

\*T. Martin, *The Affirmative Action Empire*, Chapter 1 (R)

\*R. Suny, "State-Building & Nation-Making: The Soviet Experience" in Suny, *The Revenge of the Past*, 3 (R)

\*B. Olivier, "Korenizatsiia", *Central Asia Survey*, 1990, 9,3, pages 77-98 (P)

\*E. Walker, *Dissolution*, Chapter 2 (P)

\*D.V. Schwartz (ed.), *Resolutions and Decisions of the CPSU: Brezhnev Years*, 205-212, 250-255 (P)

\*Documents, Lenin, Stalin, Treaty, Constitution, CPSU Program (P)

#### 5 **Gorbachev and the Collapse of the Multinational State: Ad Hocism or Strategy?**

\*R. Suny, *Revenge of the Past*, Chapter 4 (R)

\*H. Carrere d'Encausse, *The End of the Soviet Empire*, Chapters 1,10,11 (R)

\*CPSU, *Programme of the CPSU* (1986), section on national relations (P)

\*CPSU, *Resolutions of the 19th All-Union CPSU Conference* ("On Relations Between Soviet Nationalities") (P)

\*CPSU, *The Party's Nationalities Policy in Today's Conditions* (1989) (P)

#### **Gorbachev's Political Options: Federalism, Economic Autonomy, Legal Reform, Secession**

\*G.W. Lapidus, "Gorbachev and the "National Question: Restructuring the Soviet Federation", *Soviet Economy*, 1989, 5,3,201-250. (P)

\*R.E. Ericson, "Soviet Economic Structure and the National Question" in A. Motyl (ed), *The Post-Soviet Nations*, Chpt 10 (P)

\*Drafts of new Union Treaty (P)

\*Laws of the USSR on (All in (P))

"Procedures for Resolving Questions Related to the Secession of Union Republics from the USSR", *CDSP*, XLII, 15,20-21,32.

"Increasing Liability for Encroachments on the National Equality of Citizens & for Forcible Violation of the Unity of USSR Territory", *CDSP*, XLII, 16, 1990, 21-32.

"The Languages of the Peoples of the USSR", *CDSP*, XLII, 22, 15-17, 28.

"Freedom of Conscience and Religious Organizations", *CDSP*, XLII, 40, 6-8,31

"Public Associations", *CDSP*, XLII, 43, 18-21

"Procedures for Exit from USSR & Entry into USSR by USSR Citizens", *CDSP*, XLIII, 26, 14-16

"The Press and Other News Media", *CDSP*, XLII, 25, 16-20

"Law of the USSR on the Principles of Economic Relations between the USSR and the Union and Autonomous Republics", *CDSP*, XLII, 24, 1990, 17-19.

Students may find the following collections useful sources for classroom discussions and background reading for the topics on **post-Soviet nation- and state-building**:

G. Smith (ed), *The Nationalities Question in the Post-Soviet States* (2<sup>nd</sup> edition)  
 I. Bremmer & R. Taras (eds), *New States, New Politics: Building the Post-Soviet Nations*  
 L. Hajda & M. Beissinger (eds), *The Nationalities Factor in Soviet Politics and Society*  
 Alexei Arbatov, et. al., (eds), *Managing Conflict in the Former Soviet Union*

#### 6. **Nationalism and State Building in Post-Communist Societies**

\*R. Brubaker, "Nationhood and the National Question in the Soviet Union & Post-Soviet Eurasia" in Brubaker, *Theory and Society*, Vol 23, No. 1 1994, 47-78 (EJ)

\*G. Lapidus, "Ethnicity & State-Building: Accommodating Ethnic Differences in Post-Soviet Eurasia" in M. Beissinger & C. Young (eds), *Beyond State Crisis?*, Chapter 13 (P)

\*G. Smith, *Nation-Building in Post-Soviet Borderlands*, Chpt 1 ("Post-Colonialism & Borderland Identities") (P)

#### 7. **The Baltic Nations: The 'Exit' Option & Ethnic Democracy**

For background on the nations: G. Smith, *The Nationalities Question in the Post-Soviet States* Chapters 7 – 9 (Kionka & Vetik, Smith, Senn)

\*Priit Jarve, "Re-Independent Estonia" in S. Smooha and P. Jarve (eds), *The Fate of Ethnic Democracy in Post-Communist Europe*, 61-80/. Available online at [http://lgi.osi.hu/publications/2005/277/ECMI\\_IIIIXOXX1.pdf](http://lgi.osi.hu/publications/2005/277/ECMI_IIIIXOXX1.pdf)

\*S. Diatchkova, "Ethnic Democracy in Latvia" in S. Smooha and P. Jarve (eds), *The Fate of Ethnic Democracy in Post-Communist Europe*, 81-114. Available online at [http://lgi.osi.hu/publications/2005/277/ECMI\\_IIIIXOXX1.pdf](http://lgi.osi.hu/publications/2005/277/ECMI_IIIIXOXX1.pdf)

\*James Hughes, "'Exit' in Deeply Divided Societies: Regimes of Discrimination in Estonia & Latvia & the Potential for Russophone Migration", *Journal of Common Market Studies*, 43, 4, 739-762 (EJ)

#### 8. **The Caucasus: Inter-Ethnic Conflict**

For background on the nations: G. Smith, *The Nationalities Question in the Post-Soviet States*, Chapters 13 – 15 (Herzig, Dragadze, Jones & Parsons)

\*A. Altstadt, "Ethnic Conflict in Nagorno-Karabagh", in L. Drobizhova, et. al., *Ethnic Conflict in the Post-Soviet World*, Chpt. 13 (P)

\*J. Wheatley, 'Managing ethnic diversity in Georgia: one step forward, two steps back', *Central Asian Survey*, 28: 2, 2009, 119 — 134 (EJ)

Russian Analytical Digest, "Russia And The Conflict In Georgia", 4 September 2008 / No. 45, pages 2-8, 15,16. Available at <http://www.res.ethz.ch/analysis/rad/details.cfm?lng=en&id=90991>

9. **Central Asia: Local Resistance, Autonomy & the Search for Identity**

For background on the nations: G. Smith, *The Nationalities Question in the Post-Soviet States*, Chapters 16 – 20 (Svanberg, Akiner, Bohr, Payne, Bohr & Crisp)

\*G. Smith, et. al., “The Central Asian States as Nationalising Regimes”, in Smith, et. al., *Nation-Building in the Post-Soviet Borderlands*, Chapter 7 (P)

\*E. Karin & A. Chebotarev, “The Policy of Kazakhization in State and Government Institutions in Kazakhstan” available online at IDE-JETRO site (<http://www.ide.go.jp/English/Publish?Mes/51.html>) Chapter 2 of Publication No. 51, *The Nationalities Question in Post-Soviet Kazakhstan*

10. **Ukraine, Belarus & Moldova: Building National Identities**

For backgrounds on the nations: G. Smith, *The Nationalities Question in the Post-Soviet States*, Chapters 10 – 12 (Duncan, Clem, Eyal & Smith)

P. D’Anieri, “Ethnic Tensions and State Strategies: Understanding the Survival of the Ukrainian State”, *Journal of Communist Studies & Transition Politics*, 23 (1), March 2007, 4-29 (EJ)

K. Wolczuk, “History, Europe & the “National Idea”: The “Official” Narrative of National Identity in Ukraine”, *Nationality Papers*, 28,4, 2000 (EJ)

M. Vahl & M. Emerson, “Moldova & the Transnistrian Conflict” in *JEMIE*, Issue 1/2004 “Europeanization and Conflict Resolution: Case Studies from the European Periphery”, <http://www.ecmi.de/jemie/download/1-2004Chapter4.pdf>

N. Leshchenko, “A Fine Instrument: Two Nation-Building Strategies in Post-Soviet Belarus”, *Nations and Nationalism*, 10 (3), 2004, 333-352 (EJ)

11. **Russia: Imperial Nation or Nation State?**

For backgrounds on the nations: G. Smith, *The Nationalities Question in the Post-Soviet States*, Chapter 3 – 6, 24 (Dixon, Broxup, Vitebsky, Humphrey, Aasland)

\*V. Tolz, “Forging the Nation: National Identity & Nation Building in Post-Communist Russia”, *Europe-Asia Studies*, 50, 6, 1998, 993-1022 (EJ)

\*G. Smith, “Russia, Ethnoregionalism and the Politics of Federation”, *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 19, 2 (April 1996), 391-410 (P)

\*N.M. Moukhariamov, “The Tatarstan Model: A Situational Dynamic” in P. Stavrakis, et. al. (eds), *Beyond the Monolith*, Chapter 11 (P)

\*G. Lapidus, “The Dynamics of Secession in the Russian Federation: Why Chechnya?”, in M. Alexseev (ed), *Center-Periphery Conflict in Post-Soviet Russia: A Federation Imperiled*, Chapter 2 (P)

\*John Russell, “Ramzan Kadyrov: The Indigenous Key to Success in Putin’s Chechenization Strategy?”, *Nationalities Papers*, Vol. 36, No. 4, September 2008 (EJ)

\*C. Codagnone & V. Filippov, “Equity, Exit & National Identity in Multinational Federation: ‘Multicultural Constitutional Patriotism’ Project in Russia”, *Jour of Ethnic & Migration Studies*, 26,2, April 2000, 263-288

(EJ)

POL 422S / 2324S

Spring Term 2011

**Book Review Assignment**

Undertake a review of **ONE** of the following books:

- M. Beissinger, *Nationalist Mobilization and the Collapse of the Soviet Union*
- H. Carriere d'Encausse, *The End of the Soviet Empire*
- B. Fowkes, *The Disintegration of the Soviet Union*
- F. Hirsch, *Empire of Nations*
- R. Kaiser, *The Geography of Nationalism in Russia and the USSR*
- A. Khazanov, *Soviet Nationality Policy During Perestroika*
- T. Martin, *The Affirmative Action Empire*
- B. Nahaylo & V. Swoboda, *Soviet Disunion*
- G. Simon, *Nationalism and Policy toward the Nationalities in the Soviet Union*
- R. Suny, *The Revenge of the Past*
- R. Suny & T. Martin (eds), *A State of Nations*

Your review should include the following components:

- The **theme** of the book;
- The **argument** made by the author, especially with regard to nation-destroying / nation-building in the USSR;
- The **evidence** presented to support the theme and argument;
- **Conclusions** of the author, especially with regard to the nature of Soviet nationality policy and the role of nationalities in the collapse of the Soviet Union.

All books are available on short-term loan at the **Robarts Library**.

**Other books** may be used for review. However, other books must be approved by the instructor before the review is undertaken.

Your review should be a maximum of **five pages, double spaced, 12 point font, 1" margins**.

The review is due in class on **Wednesday March 2, 2011**.