

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

POLITICAL SCIENCE 434F/2025F

ENLIGHTENMENT AND ITS CRITICS

FALL SESSION 2016

Professor C. Orwin ([clifford.orwin@utoronto.ca](mailto:clifford.orwin@utoronto.ca))

No critic of the Enlightenment was as profound or as influential as Jean-Jacques Rousseau, yet nor was any more deeply rooted in its thought. A self-educated genius and intransigent outsider, Rousseau understood the then already entrenched modern thought of his day better than any of its proponents. And rather than reject its premises, he radicalized them, providing the first great modern critique of the modern project, while establishing the template for all subsequent ones. Burrowing from deep within the modern project, he showed how far modern thought (and with it modern politics) still had to go to to be true to its own basic insights. He showed how the modern thought of the 17<sup>th</sup> and 18<sup>th</sup> Centuries (the "Enlightenment") inevitably implied the very different versions of the 19<sup>th</sup> Century and after. No other thinker of the 18<sup>th</sup> Century is so contemporary with our own. Neither was any so celebrated or so controversial, so adulated or so detested: Rousseau's stormy personal life was perennially intertwined in it.)

In our course we will read Rousseau's first three major political writings, as well as some of the controversies that they provoked. While longer works were to follow -- the *Emile* or on Education, the *Social Contract*, the novel *Julie*, the *Confessions* and other autobiographical and polemical writings, and the late, incomplete, and mysterious *Reveries of the Solitary Walker*- these early writings were understood by both Rousseau and his critics to have expounded the foundations of his thought. All three combined the deeply theoretical with the intensely political. And all three were expressed in Rousseau's unique (and uniquely inflammatory) rhetoric.

RECOMMENDED TRANSLATION (AVAILABLE AT THE BOB MILLER BOOK ROOM)

Rousseau, Jean-Jacques. *The Discourses and other early political writings*, ed. and transl. by Victor Gourevitch. Cambridge and New York : Cambridge U.P., 1997. This edition does not contain the *Discourse on Political Economy*, which will be provided for you.

## RECOMMENDED SECONDARY READINGS: BOOKS

- Black, Jeff. *Rousseau's Critique of Science: A Commentary on the Discourse on the Sciences and the Arts*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2009. PQ2040 .D7 B53 2009X Black was my student as an undergraduate.
- Cooper, Laurence D. *Rousseau, Nature, and the Problem of the Good Life*. State College: Penn State University Press, 1999. Another intelligent Rousseauian with whom I love to differ. B2138 .M3 C66 1999X
- Cranston, Maurice. *Hobbes and Rousseau. A Collection of Critical Essays*. New York: Anchor Books, 1972. B1247 .C7
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Jean-Jacques. The Early Life and Work of J.-J. Rousseau, 1712-1754*. New York: W.W. Norton, 1983. B2136 .C73 1983
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Noble Savage. J.-J. Rousseau, 1754-1762*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991. PQ2043 .C73 1991
- Cullen, Daniel E. *Freedom in Rousseau's Political Philosophy*. DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 1993. A solid treatment of a fundamental issue. JC179 .R9 C85 1993
- Forde, Steven. "Locke's Compassion - and Rousseau's." In Andrea Radasanu, ed. *In Search of Humanity: Essays in Honor of Clifford Orwin*. Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2015, 303-315. BJ1533 .H9 I528 2015X Forde, who was my doctoral student, is a leading scholar of Thucydides, Grotius, and Locke.
- Garrard, Graeme. *Rousseau's Counter-Enlightenment: A Republican Critique of the Philosophes*. Albany: SUNY Press, 2003. B2137 .G27 2003X Garrard was my student as an undergraduate.
- Grace, Eve, and Christopher Kelly, ed. *The Challenge of Rousseau*. Cambridge: Cambridge U.P., 2013. An outstanding recent collection of essays; especially relevant to our course are Ryan Hanley on Rousseau's economics and Pamela Jensen on Rousseau on public opinion. Grace and Kelly are alumni of our doctoral program.
- Horowitz, Asher. *Rousseau, Human Nature, and History*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1987. An intelligent analysis from the Left by yet another U of T Ph.D. PQ 2053 H67 1987
- Kelly, Christopher J. *Rousseau as Author: Consecrating One's Life to Truth*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003. A very fine book by an alumnus of our program and one of the leading Rousseau scholars of today. PQ2056 .E85 K45 2003X
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Rousseau and the Case for and against Cosmopolitan Humanitarianism." In Radasanu (above s.v. Forde), 331-345.
- MacLean, Lee Margaret. *The Free Animal. Rousseau on Free Will and Human Nature*.

- Toronto: U of T Press, 2013. The revised dissertation of another doctoral alumna of mine.
- Marks, Jonathan. *Perfection and Disharmony in the Thought of Jean-Jacques Rousseau*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005. B2138 .M3 M37 2005  
ALSO AVAILABLE AS ON LINE RESOURCE By a graduate student of mine during my year at at Chicago, who has made a career of his friendly disagreements with me.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Rousseau's Discriminating Defense of Compassion." *The American Political Science Review* 101, no. 4 (2007): 727-39.  
<http://www.jstor.org.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/stable/27644481>
- Melzer, Arthur M. *The Natural Goodness of Man. On the System of Rousseau's Thought*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990. Possibly the best single volume on the system of Rousseau's thought. B2138 .M3 M44 1990
- Orwin, Clifford. "Rousseau between two liberalisms: his critique of the older liberalism and his contribution to the newer one," in João Carlos Espada, Marc F. Plattner, and Adam Wolfson, ed., *The Liberal Tradition in Focus. Problems and New Perspectives* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2000), 53-65. JC574 .L5185 2000X
- Orwin, Clifford, and Nathan Tarcov, ed. *The Legacy of Rousseau*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997. JC179 .R9 L44 1997X A collection of essays on Rousseau in memory of Allan Bloom. Of particular relevance to us are the contributions of Dannhauser, Kelly, Melzer, Orwin, and Plattner.
- Palmer, Michael. "The Citizen Philosopher: Rousseau's Dedicatory Letter to the *Discourse on Inequality*," in Palmer, *Masters and Slaves: Revisioned Essays in Political Philosophy* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2001. JA81 .P28 2001X Originally published in the journal *Interpretation*, vol. 17 (1989). JA1 .I6 Palmer was an undergraduate student of mine.
- Philonenko, Alexis. *J.-J. Rousseau et la pensée du malheur. Vol. 2: L'espoir et l'existence*. Paris: J. Vrin, 1984. B 2137 .P48 1984 ROBA 3 Rousseau as viewed by a leading French scholar of classical and German thought.
- Plattner, Marc. *Rousseau's State of Nature. An interpretation of the Discourse on inequality*. DeKalb: Northern Illinois University Press, 1979. JC179 .R9 P57
- Schwartz, Joel. *The Sexual Politics of J.-J. Rousseau*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1985. HQ23 .S35 1984
- Scott, John T., ed. *Rousseau. Critical Assessments*. New York and London: Routledge, 2006. Volume 1: *Paradoxes and Interpretations*; Volume 2: *Human Nature and History*; Volume 3: *Political Principles and Institutions*; Volume 4: *Politics, Arts, and Autobiography*. JC179 .R9 J4337 2006 vv.1-4 This massive compendium (ca. 1600 pages) will remain the most valuable collection in English of essays on Rousseau.

*Our course motto: The cowards never started, the weak died along the way.*

- 4-

Shklar, Judith N. *Men and Citizens. Rousseau's Social Theory*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1969. JC179 .R9 S55

Todorov, Tzvetan. *Frail Happiness: An Essay on Rousseau*. Trans. and ed. John T. Scott and Robert A. Zaretsky. State College: Penn State University Press, 2001. A leading contemporary French intellectual looks at Rousseau. B2137 .T5713 2001X

Velkley, Richard L. *Being After Rousseau. Philosophy and Culture in Question*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001. Velkley's collected essays on Rousseau and German philosophy. Of particular interest to us is the second: "Speech, Imagination, Origins: Rousseau and the Political Animal." (Originally published in Orwin and Tarcov, above.)

Wokler, Robert. *Rousseau, the Age of Enlightenment, and their legacies*, ed. Bryan Garsten; with an introduction by Christopher Brooke. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012. B2137 .W65 2012X **ALSO AVAILABLE AS ELECTRONIC RESOURCE** The collected papers of one of the leading Rousseau scholars of the past sixty years.

These readings will be on two-hour reserve in the short-term loan area on the third floor of Robarts Library. I hope you'll come to love that little room, as you'll be spending so much time there. Note, however, that the library system has multiple copies of many of these items, so you may be able to check one out. And where the work is translated from the French, you may be able to check out the original.

**RECOMMENDED SECONDARY READINGS: ARTICLES (not on reserve at Robarts Library, but available in the stacks there as periodicals are noncirculating.)**

Boyd, Richard. Pity's Pathologies Portrayed: Rousseau and the Limits of Democratic Compassion. *Political Theory* 32:4 (2004), 519-546, Boyd was an undergraduate student of mine.

Grace, Eve N. "The restlessness of 'being:' Rousseau's protean sentiment of existence." *History of European Ideas* 27.2 (2001): 133-151. D1 H817

Marshall, Terence. "Art d'écrire et pratique politique de J.-J. Rousseau," I and II. *Revue de métaphysique et de morale* 89.2 &3 (1984): 232-61, 322-47. B2 .R2

Melzer, Arthur. "Rousseau and the Problem of Bourgeois Society," *American Political Science Review* 74.2 (1981): 1018-1033. JA1 .A6

Orwin, Clifford. "Rousseau's Socratism." *Journal of Politics* 60.1 (1998): 175-87. JA1 .J6

Strauss, Leo. "On the intention of Rousseau." *Social Research* 14.4 (1947): 455-87. H1 .S53

**SEVERAL OF THESE PERIODICALS ARE ALSO AVAILABLE THROUGH THE LIBRARY WEB SITE AS ON LINE RESOURCES.**

#### **COURSE ASSIGNMENTS AND MARKING SCHEME**

**POL 434F (the undergraduate course).** Two essays of 2750 words each on assigned topics due October 20 and November 17; a take-home exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, November 25, due at 11 AM on Monday, November 28), each assignment worth a third of the final mark.

**POL 2025F (the graduate course).** Two essays, one of 4000 words on an assigned topic, due October 20 and one of 5500 words on a topic of the student's own devising due December 8, a take-home exam (to be distributed the afternoon of Friday, November 25, due at 11 AM on Monday, November 28); each assignment worth a third of the final mark.

In each of your essays you will be expected to cite at least six secondary sources (i.e., books or articles, at least three of which, however, must be books).

**PLEASE SUBMIT YOUR ESSAYS ELECTRONICALLY, THEREBY SPARING CANADA'S FORESTS.**

N.B. In the graduate course as in the undergraduate one, no extensions will be granted on written work except for good cause. In keeping with Nietzsche's theory of punishment, however, according to which every crime has its price and punishment was originally nothing more than an exaction of that price (cf. *On the Genealogy of Morals*, Second Essay), extensions will be readily available to those willing to purchase them. The price will be 3 points, plus 2 additional points per day beginning with the first, off your mark for that assignment. (If you are one day late you will lose 5 points; two days late, 7; etc.). This proviso does not apply to the take-home exam, late submission of which will not be accepted.

#### **ACADEMIC INTEGRITY ISSUES (READ THESE PARAGRAPHS SIX OR SEVEN TIMES)**

The University of Toronto treats cases of academic misconduct very seriously. Academic integrity is a fundamental value of learning and scholarship at the UofT. Participating honestly, respectfully, responsibly, and fairly in this academic community ensures that your UofT degree is valued and respected as a true signifier of your individual academic achievement.

The University of Toronto's [Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters](#) outlines the behaviours that constitute academic misconduct, the processes for addressing academic offences, and the penalties that may be imposed. You are expected to be familiar with the contents of this document. Potential offences include, but are not limited to:

In papers and assignments:

- Using someone else's ideas or words without appropriate acknowledgement.
- Submitting your own work in more than one course without the permission of the instructor.
- Making up sources or facts.
- Obtaining or providing unauthorized assistance on any assignment (this includes working in groups on assignments that are supposed to be individual work).

On tests and exams:

- Using or possessing any unauthorized aid, including a cell phone.
- Looking at someone else's answers.
- Letting someone else look at your answers.
- Misrepresenting your identity.
- Submitting an altered test for re-grading.

Misrepresentation:

- Falsifying or altering any documentation required by the University, including (but not limited to) doctor's notes.
- Falsifying institutional documents or grades.

All suspected cases of academic dishonesty will be investigated following the procedures outlined in the Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters. If you have any questions about what is or is not permitted in this course, please do not hesitate to contact me. If you have questions about appropriate research and citation methods, you are expected to seek out additional information from me or other available campus resources like the [College Writing Centres](#), the [Academic Success Centre](#), or the [U of T Writing Website](#).

**STUDENTS WILL BE EXPECTED TO SUBMIT THEIR COURSE ESSAYS TO TURNITIN.COM FOR A REVIEW OF TEXTUAL SIMILARITY AND DETECTION OF POSSIBLE PLAGIARISM. IN DOING SO, STUDENTS WILL ALLOW THEIR ESSAYS TO BE INCLUDED AS SOURCE DOCUMENTS IN THE TURNITIN.COM REFERENCE DATABASE, WHERE THEY WILL BE USED SOLELY FOR THE PURPOSE OF DETECTING PLAGIARISM. THE TERMS THAT APPLY TO THE UNIVERSITY'S USE OF THE TURNITIN.COM SERVICE ARE DESCRIBED ON THE TURNITIN.COM WEB SITE.**

If you object to using turnitin.com, please see me to establish alternative arrangements for submission of your assignments.

**Plagiarism is a serious academic offense and will be dealt with accordingly. A FIRST ACT OF PLAGIARISM MAY COST YOU A COURSE; A SECOND MAY COST YOU YOUR CAREER AS A STUDENT.**

**MR ORWIN'S OFFICE HOURS (FALL TERM ONLY)**

Wednesdays from 4 to 6 in Sidney Smith 3055. Messages are better left at my office at St. Mike's (416-926-1300, ext. 3277), where I have voice mail. In an emergency, dial 911; if they can't help you, then call me at home.

*And, for those who missed it, our course motto: The cowards never started, the weak died along the way.*

**SCHEDULE OF CLASSES.**

**SEPTEMBER 13** *DISCOURSE ON THE SCIENCES AND THE ARTS*, FRONTISPIECE, TITLE PAGE, PREFACE, INTRODUCTION, AND FIRST PART

**SEPTEMBER 20** *DISCOURSE ON THE SCIENCES AND THE ARTS*, SECOND PART

**SEPTEMBER 27** REACTION AND RESPONSE (GOUREVITCH, PP. 29-110)

**OCTOBER 4** *DISCOURSE ON THE ORIGINS OF INEQUALITY*, FRONTISPIECE, TITLE PAGE, DEDICATORY LETTER TO THE REPUBLIC OF GENEVA, PREFACE, NOTICE ABOUT THE NOTES, EXORDIUM AND NOTES I AND II)

**OCTOBER 11** KOL NIDREI, NO CLASS

**OCTOBER 18** *DISCOURSE ON THE ORIGINS OF INEQUALITY*. FIRST PART (PARAGRAPHS 1-17 AND NOTES III-IX)

**OCTOBER 25** *DISCOURSE ON THE ORIGINS OF INEQUALITY*. FIRST PART (PARAGRAPHS 18-33 AND NOTES X-XIV)

**NOVEMBER 1** *DISCOURSE ON THE ORIGINS OF INEQUALITY*. FIRST PART (PARAGRAPHS 34-53 AND NOTE XV}

**NOVEMBER 8** AUTUMN BREAK, NO CLASS

**NOVEMBER 15** *DISCOURSE ON THE ORIGINS OF INEQUALITY*. SECOND PART (PARAGRAPHS 1-18 AND NOTE XVI)

**NOVEMBER 22** *DISCOURSE ON THE ORIGINS OF INEQUALITY*. SECOND PART

*Our course motto: The cowards never started, the weak died along the way.*

- 8-

(PARAGRAPHS 19-37 AND NOTES XVII AND XVIII)

NOVEMBER 29 *DISCOURSE ON THE ORIGINS OF INEQUALITY*. SECOND PART (PARAGRAPHS 38-58 AND NOTE XIX)

DECEMBER 6 REACTION AND RESPONSE (GOUREVITCH, PP. 223-246)

DECEMBER 7 ("MAKEUP MONDAY," THOUGH IT'S A WEDNESDAY) *DISCOURSE ON POLITICAL ECONOMY*