

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
Department of Political Science
2012-13

Intensive POL Course (POL 498H/2801H1 F)

THE RUDDERLESS STATE: POLITICAL CRISIS AND CIVIL WARS IN SUDAN

Taisier Ali (Ph.D. University of Toronto)
Director, Peacebuilding Centre for the Horn of Africa (PCHA),
Asmara, Eritrea.

Course Description

For decades, many scholars and political observers, within and outside Sudan, viewed the country's ethnic, cultural, religious and geographic diversity as a microcosm of Africa. Others considered it a "bridge" linking Middle Eastern and African Arabs with black Africa. Unfortunately, such images have been shattered by the result of the January 2011 Referendum in South Sudan in which 98% voted in favor of separation and establishing a new sovereign state.

South Sudan's independence has emboldened calls for self-determination in other war-torn and marginalized communities of Darfur, Blue Nile, Nuba Mountains, Eastern Sudan and the extreme Northern Nubian territories.

In addition, there are serious fears as to whether the state in North Sudan can withstand the loss of about seventy-five per cent of oil revenue appropriated by the newly born Republic of South Sudan after independence on July 9th 2011. The questions that may be investigated include: In view of the long history of broken promises, will the ruling National Congress Party (NCP) honor the peace agreements it had signed or will it continue fanning the flames of war by financing and arming local militias in the south and elsewhere? Will the NCP be more willing to renegotiate power and wealth sharing arrangements with the remaining regions of the country? Will the NCP be prepared to reconsider its management of Sudan's ethnic, cultural and religious diversity? Will the breakaway of South Sudan contribute to regional stability and peaceful coexistence between and within the two new sovereign states; or, will civil wars linger on, albeit through other means?

The course will examine the above questions as well as study the processes that prevented Sudan from realizing its economic and political potentials; and, concurrently contributed to and aggravate conflicts and other crises – a state of affairs that may endure even after the secession of the South.

Ultimately, this examination of the Sudanese case has wider theoretical and practical implications for attempts to understand the root causes for recurring violent conflicts and the concomitant potential threat of a rise in the number of dysfunctional states in Africa. Moreover, the changing character of the post-colonial state in Africa, its structures, functions and relations has led some to question the validity of the term as an analytical category in the context of contemporary African realities.

Course Outline

1. Sudan: An overview of a state in crisis

Despite the country's massive economic & agricultural potential it remains among the 25 least developed countries in the world. Also, since achieving political independence in 1956 the country's ruling elite have failed to end civil wars in which it is now estimated that 2 million people died in the South; and, an additional 400,000 in Darfur, Blue Nile, Eastern and the extreme Northern parts of the country. Besides, at present Sudan holds a world record in the number of internal peace agreements signed, UN Security Council resolutions passed on it, and internally displaced persons (IDPs) as well as refugees - all under a regime presided over by the only current head of state charged by the ICC for crimes against humanity and genocide.

- Ali, Taisier M. and Matthews, Robert O. "Civil War and Failed Peace Efforts in Sudan," in *Civil Wars in Africa: Roots and Resolution*, ed. Taisier M. Ali and Robert O. Matthews (Montreal: McGill-Queens University Press, 1999).
- de Waal, Alex, Sudan: The Turbulent, in, State Alex de Waal (ed.) *War in Darfur and the Search for Peace* (Cambridge:Harvard University Press, 2007).
- Garang John; Khalid Mansur, *The Call for Democracy in Sudan* (New York : Kegan Paul International, 1992.
- *Johnson, Douglas: The Root Causes of Sudan's Civil Wars* (Bloomington IN: Indiana University Press, 2003).
 - Ch. 1: Preface to the Revised Edition.
 - Chapter 6: The Beginning of the Second Civil War 1983-85 – Interlude.
 - Chapter10: Multiple Civil Wars
 - Chapter 12: Comprehensive Peace or Temporary Truce?

2. Sources of Conflict: Marginalization and the dilemma of national identity

Within the Sudan there exist widely divergent explanations for the root causes of civil wars and other crises. Some believe them to be the product of colonial legacy, while several others blame external interventions and foreign conspiracies. However, the proliferation of violent conflicts to various regions of the country and particularly the secession of the South cannot be explained away by such mechanistic arguments. Essentially, regional disparities and the related processes of socio-economic, cultural & political marginalization coupled with the ruling elite's failure to manage diversity and address the contending visions of national identity are fundamental factors in the crises.

- Deng, Francis M. (ed), *New Sudan in the Making? Essays on a nation in painful search of itself* (Trenton NJ, Sea Press, 2010. The following chapters:-
 - Sudan at the crossroads / Francis M. Deng,
 - Portrait of a divided nation / Francis M. Deng,
 - Beyond "African" and "Arab" / Amir Idris,
 - The turbulent road to nationhood / Francis M. Deng,
 - Anatomy of the war in Darfur / Eltigani Seisi M. Ateem,
 - Kordofan : between old and New Sudan / Mohamed Salih,
 - Toward the self-determination referendum and beyond / Mansour Khalid,
 - Managing diversity and peace in post-conflict Sudan / Luka Biong Deng,
 - The CPA as an embodiment of the New Sudan / John G. Nyuot Yoh,
 - Tributes to Dr. John Garang de Mabior / Francis M. Deng,

- Justice & Equality Movement (JEM), *The Black Book: Imbalance of Power and Wealth in Sudan*, (JEM web page), 2004. <http://www.colloboard.org/resources/Black%20Book%20of%20Sudan.pdf>
- Mosely Ann Lesch; *The Sudan: Contested National Identities* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1998).
 - Chapters: Introduction and Conclusion.

3. Regime Changes and Unresolved crisis (1956-89).

From its early days the postcolonial state faced a most serious manifestation of political crisis—civil war in South Sudan. Yet, on the whole, successive regimes handled the conflict simply as a military challenge instigated by foreign interests coupled with political opportunism and ethnic rivalry but never a fully-fledged national emergency rooted in mismanaged ethnic, cultural, economic and political diversities.

- Cockett, Richard, *Sudan: Darfur and the failure of an African State* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010).
- Introduction & Chapter 1: The one-city state 1
- Deng, Francis M., “Africa's dilemmas in the Sudan”, *The World Today* (1998), vol. 54, no. 3, p. 72-74.
- Khalid, Mansour, *War and Peace in Sudan: A Tale of Two Countries* (London: Kegan Paul, 2003).
- *Nimeiri and the Revolution of Dis-May* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1985).
- Ahmad A. Sikainga, “Northern Sudanese Political Parties and the Civil War” in, M. W. Daly et al., *Civil war in the Sudan* (London: St. Martin's Press, 1993).

4. Islamist Regime and the Changing Dynamics of the Conflict

The 1989 military coup represented an important turning point in Sudan's contemporary history, in terms of both its timing and consequences. The sudden, forced and often brutal Islamization of the state apparatus almost instantly changed not only the character of the state but also of its conflicts. In turn, this development intensified the ferocity and range of the civil war and, in time, carried the fighting to other parts of North Sudan. Hence, the nature of the fighting has changed drastically into a holy war as the ruling elite declared jihad against the largely non-Muslim population “infidels” of the south and identified their region as *dar al-harb* (land of war) to be conquered and pacified.

- El-Affendi, Abdelwahab, *Turabi's Revolution: Islam and Power in Sudan*. (London: Grey Seal, 1991).
- Burr, J. Millard & Collins, Robert O. *Revolutionary Sudan: Hasan al-Turabi and the Islamist State, 1989-2000* (Brill, Leiden • Boston, 2003).
- de Waal, Alex (ed); *Islamism and its enemies in the Horn of Africa* (Hurst & Company, London, 2004).
 - Chapter 1: Introduction.
 - Chapter 3: with A. H. Abdelsalam, 'Islamism, State Power and Jihad in Sudan.'
- Gallab, Abdullahi A; *The First Islamist Republic: Development and Disintegration of Islamism in the Sudan* (Aldershot, England, 2008).
 - Chapter 7: End of the first republic.
 - Chapter 8: The road to Darfur : Islamism without al-Turabi, authoritarianism without Nimairi.

- Mantzikos, Ioannis, “Why the Islamic Revolution Ended: the Regional Politics of Sudan since 1989”, *Mediterranean Quarterly*: Summer 2010.

5. Challenges of Peacemaking in Sudan

Numerous attempts have been made at peace negotiations but few of these produced results. Many rounds of talks were entered by Khartoum to score propaganda points or in response to intensive regional and international demands/coercion. Finally, it was a combination of rigorous regional and international pressures backed by the USA, EU and all neighbors that brought about the 2005 Comprehensive Peace Agreement (CPA) ending half a century of north-south carnage. Shortly afterwards other accords were reached for Darfur, North Sudan, East Sudan and the three territories (of Nuba Mountains, Blue Nile and Abeyi) with varying degrees of success or durability.

- Ali, Taisier M., Robert O. Matthews and Ian S. Spears, “Failures of Peacebuilding: Sudan (1972-1983) and Angola (1991-1998)”, in *Durable Peace: Challenges for Peacebuilding in Africa*, (ed). Ali, Taisier M. and Matthews, Robert O. 282-314. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004.
- Cockett, Richard; Sudan, *Darfur and the failure of an African state*, New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010.
 - Chapter 1: The one-city state
 - Chapter 2: Populists and civil war, 1956-89
 - Chapter 3: The National Islamic Front and Turabi in power, 1989-2000
- El Affendi, Abdelwahab, “The impasse in the IGAD peace process for Sudan: the limits of regional peacemaking?”, *African Affairs*, (2001), vol. 100, no. 401, p. 581-599.
- Elnur, Ibrahim, *Contested Sudan: The political economy of war and reconstruction*, New York,: Routledge, 2009
 - Chapter 6: From Addis to Nivasha War-Fatigue-driven peace: agreements, sources of fragility and challenges of governance 111
 - Chapter 7: Post-Nivasha: challenges of (re)-building a war-produced economy 135
 - Appendix II: Sudan Long Peace Negotiation Marathon:
 - Appendix II: A. Key Texts on Peace Agreements and Declarations* (From Addis 1972 to 2006)
- Johnson, Hilde F., *Waging peace in Sudan - the inside story of the negotiations that ended Africa's longest civil war*. Eastbourne: Sussex Academic Press, 2011.
- ICG, *Sudan : saving peace in the east*; ICG Africa report, no. 102.; Policy report. International Crisis Group, 2006.
- ICG, *Sudan's Comprehensive Peace Agreement : beyond the crisis*; International Crisis Group., Nairobi ; Brussels, 2008.
- Young, John, “Sudan: A Flawed Peace Process Leading To a Flawed Peace”, *Review of African Political Economy*, (2005), vol. 32, no. 103, p. 99-113.

6. Dishonored Agreements and Territorial Fragmentation

Hardly any of the peace agreements were fully implemented, as the ruling elite have habitually lacked minimal political will to fulfill their obligations. Accordingly, accords were either completely dishonored or important provisions remained unimplemented. This phenomenon has further complicated the search for durable peace and fuelled demands for self-determination and separation among other

marginalized communities that lost confidence in possibilities for equitable sharing power and wealth or allow enjoying basic rights within the same country.

- Almquist, Katherine, *Renewed Conflict in Sudan*, Council on Foreign Relations - Center for Preventive Action Contingent Planning Memorandum No: 7 (March 2010).
- Laurie, Nathan, The Making and Unmaking of the Darfur Peace Agreement, in Alex de Waal (ed.) *War in Darfur and the Search for Peace*, Harvard University Press, 2007.
- Laurie, Nathan, “No Ownership, No Peace: the Darfur Peace Agreement” in *Crisis State Working Papers No.2*, Crisis State Research Center, September 2006.
http://se2.isn.ch/serviceengine/Files/RESSpecNet/57847/ipublicationdocument_singledocument/80ADB6BF-76F9-4866-9A77-B6FB42CC6967/en/WP5.2.pdf
- Pantuliano, Sara, “Comprehensive peace? : An Analysis of the Evolving Tension in Eastern Sudan”, *Review of African Political Economy*, (2006), vol. 33, no. 110, p. 709-720.
[http://protection.unsudanig.org/data/east/Pantuliano %20% 20East% 20Sudan %20 Analysis%20\(Sep05\).pdf](http://protection.unsudanig.org/data/east/Pantuliano%20%20East%20Sudan%20Analysis%20(Sep05).pdf)
- Spaulding; Jay et al; *Sudan's war and peace agreements*, (Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars, 2010).

7. Implications of Conflict in Sudan on Regional Security

Sudan, once the largest country on the African continent, spans between three extremely volatile regions — the Horn of Africa, Red Sea basin/Middle East and Great Lakes. The country’s location and geopolitical potential could have allowed for a lead role in regional stability, food security and economic cooperation. Instead, the country has become a major source of instability in the region through the mismanagement of its domestic as well as foreign relations or maintaining effective control over its territory rendering it a safe haven for some unsavory elements. In response, countries of the region attempted to reach bilateral settlements with Khartoum and, at the same time, help to contain Sudan’s domestic crisis.

- Clapham, Christopher; *Africa and the International System*;(Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
 - Ch. 1: Fragile states and the international system.
 - Ch. 5: The Politics of Solidarity.
- Cliffe, Lionel, Regional Dimensions of Conflict in the Horn of Africa, *Third World Quarterly*, Vol. 20, No. 1, Complex Political Emergencies (Feb., 1999), pp.89-111Published by:
- Giroux, Jennifer Lanz , David, Sguaitamatti Damiano, *The Tormented Triangle: The Regionalization of Conflict in Sudan, Chad and The Central African Republic*, Working Paper no. 47 -Regional and Global Axes of Conflict - Center for Security Studies, ETH, and SwissPeace, April 2009 Crisis States Working Papers Series No.2
- Marchal, Roland, “The Unseen Regional Implications of the Crisis in Darfur”, in Alex de Waal (ed.) *War in Darfur and the Search for Peace*, (Cambridge:Harvard University Press, 2007).
- Weis, Toni, “Precarious Statehood: Understanding Regional Conflict in the Horn of Africa and Beyond”, Global Images , *Human Security Journal*, Volume 8, Spring 2009.

8. Future Scenarios

Following the birth of the Republic of South Sudan on July 2011, will fragmentation spread to other parts in Darfur, Blue Nile, Eastern Sudan, and Nuba Mountains? What are the opportunities, challenges and prospects for peace and stability in Sudan, its breakaway region(s) and with the other nine surrounding countries? Is John Garang's vision of a New Sudan still possible?

- Almquist, Katherine *Renewed Conflict in Sudan*, The Council on Foreign Relations (CFR) Contingency Planning Memorandum, March 2010.
- Cliffe, Lionel, Peace in the Horn This Year?; *Review of African Political Economy*, Vol. 30, No. 97, The Horn of Conflict (Sep. 2003), pp. 497-504.
- Dagne, Ted, *The Republic of South Sudan: Opportunities and Challenges for Africa's Newest Country*, Congressional Research Service, July 1, 2011 [www.crs.gov].
- Elnur, Ibrahim, "Chapter 8: Conclusion: Potential scenarios:", in *Contested Sudan: The political economy of war and reconstruction*, New York,: Routledge, 2009.
- Hsiao, Amanda and Jones, Laura *Rethinking Sudan after Southern Secession*, Enough Project July 2011.08.07.
- ICG, *Sudan : justice, peace and the ICC*; International Crisis Group, Nairobi; Group, 2009. Series: Africa report, No. 152
- Johnson, Douglas H, "Why Abeyi matters: The Breaking Point of Sudan's Comprehensive Peace Agreement?" *African Affairs*: (2008),vol. 107, no. 426, p. 1-19.
- Prendergast, John, A New U.S. Policy for Two New Sudans, A Policy Essay, The Enough Project, August 2011
- Schwartz, Ala, *Scenarios for Sudan: Avoiding Political Violence through 2011*. Washington, DC : United States Institute of Peace, 2009. http://www.usip.org/files/resources/SR228_0.pdf

Selected Web Resources:

- African Confidential: www.africa-confidential.com/browse-by-country/id/46/Sudan
- Amnesty International: Sudan: www.amnesty.org/en/region/sudan
- BBC (British Broadcasting Corporation), <http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/low/africa/default.stm>
- Council on Foreign Relations: www.cfr.org.
- Chatham House, (Royal Institute of International Affairs,) www.chathamhouse.org.uk.
- Comprehensive Peace Agreement (CPA), (www.aec-sudan.org/cpa.html).
- Enough Project, <http://www.enoughproject.org/>
- Foreign Policy, www.foreignpolicy.com.
- Fund for Peace, www.fundforpeace.org.
- Human Rights Watch: Sudan, (www.hrw.org/africa/sudan).
- International Crisis Group (ICC), Sudan. (www.crisisgroup.org/en/regions/africa/horn-of-africa/sudan.aspx)
- IRIN: Sudan, Integrated Regional Information Network (IRIN) (UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (news and analysis on relief,

development, social, economic and political affairs). IRIN News – Sudan, www.irinnews.org/sudan.

- [Justice Africa](http://www.justiceafrica.org/), www.justiceafrica.org/
 - Royal African Society (RAS) Analysis Reports (www.royalafricansociety.org)
 - Security Council Resolutions & Presidential statements on Sudan
 - (www.securitycouncilreport.org/site/c.glKWLeMTIsG/b.2897757/k.796A/Sudan_brUN_Documents.htm)
 - Sudan Open Archive, (www.sudanarchive.net/)
 - Sudan Tribune, (on-line independent daily news from Sudan), (www.sudantribune.com)
 - United States. Congress. (Hearings on Sudan) Senate, Committee on Foreign Relations and Congress Sub Committee on Africa.
 - United Nations Mission in Sudan, UNMIS, www.un.org/en/peacekeeping/missions/unmis
 - USIP (United States Institute of Peace), <http://www.usip.org>.
-